
Samrat Hazra

A thesis submitted in partial fulfilment of the requirements of Bournemouth University for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy

May 2011

Bournemouth University
United Kingdom
Copyright Statement

This copy of the thesis has been supplied on condition that anyone who consults it is understood to recognise that its copyright rests with its author and due acknowledgment must always be made of the use of any material contained in, or derived from, this thesis.
Abstract

This is an inductive research project which critically evaluates the application of stakeholder theory to the analysis of tourism destination networks. It explores the dynamics of the relationships between the tourism organisations involved using the case of Agra, India. Cities and towns become tourist destinations because of the activities of a large number of organisations to provide attractions, accommodation, and accessibility. Understanding the relationships between these organisations can explain how tourism developed and is currently managed, which will in turn help not only existing and potential tourism businesses but also destination management organisations to act more effectively.

This research examines the relationships of power and dependency that exist between individual and group organisations and the way in which they motivate their behaviour towards each other in a tourism industry. The review of the literature identifies the key attributes of stakeholder power in these relationships to be resource and network bases of power. However, tourism stakeholders join social networks and power can be limited by ethical constraints, either embodied in laws and regulations, or in mutually accepted codes of behaviour. These sources of influence are termed legitimacy. This research also demonstrates that urgency is an important attribute and this is examined because it is instrumental in making these relationships dynamic.

Qualitative interviews were conducted with tourism stakeholders (both commercial and non-commercial) in Agra, India to identify and analyse the perceptions, attitudes and experiences of their relationships with others within their network. Consequently, these relational-attributes were further sub-classified to aid a better understanding. An analytical framework is developed to facilitate understanding and evaluate the implications of stakeholder relationships within a tourism destination scenario. Consequently, it was found that urgency is the most important attribute of all with respect to making a decision or carrying out an act.
List of contents

Title page .............................................................................................................i
Copyright statement ..........................................................................................ii
Abstract and keywords ......................................................................................iii
Table of Contents ..............................................................................................iv
List of Tables .....................................................................................................ix
List of Figures ...................................................................................................x
List of Abbreviations ........................................................................................xi
Acknowledgements ..........................................................................................xii

Chapter 1: Introduction ...................................................................................1
  1.1 Introduction to the Research .....................................................................1
  1.2 The Structure of the Thesis ......................................................................8
  1.3 Chapter Summary .....................................................................................12

Chapter 2: Review of the Literature: Stakeholder Relationship Attributes ......13
  2.1 Introduction .............................................................................................13
  2.2 Tourism Destinations ..............................................................................13
  2.3 Stakeholders and Stakeholder Theory .......................................................15
  2.4 Chapter Summary ...................................................................................23

Chapter 3: Review of the Literature: Power and Resource Dependence ......25
  3.1 Introduction .............................................................................................25
  3.2 Power and Resource Dependence .............................................................25
  3.3 Resources ................................................................................................28
    3.3.1 Land as a Resource .........................................................................29
    3.3.2 Labour Force as a Resource .............................................................31
    3.3.3 Capital as a Resource .....................................................................34
    3.3.4 Knowledge as a Resource ...............................................................36
    3.3.5 Access to Clients as a Resource .......................................................38
3.4 Structure Based Forms of Power ................................................................. 42
  3.4.1 Density ................................................................................................. 45
  3.4.2 Centrality ............................................................................................. 45
3.5 Chapter Summary ..................................................................................... 49

Chapter 4: Review of the Literature: Legitimacy and Urgency .................. 51
  4.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 51
  4.2 Legitimacy ................................................................................................ 51
    4.2.1 Indirect Exporting ............................................................................. 53
    4.2.2 Direct Exporting .............................................................................. 54
    4.2.3 Licensing ........................................................................................... 55
    4.2.4 Joint Ventures .................................................................................. 56
    4.2.5 Direct Investment ............................................................................. 56
  4.3 Urgency ...................................................................................................... 60
  4.4 Power Relations and Interrelationships .................................................. 61
  4.5 Chapter Summary ..................................................................................... 65

Chapter 5: Case Study Chapter: Agra, India ............................................. 67
  5.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 67
  5.2 The Research Context ............................................................................. 67
  5.3 Chapter Summary ..................................................................................... 78

Chapter 6: Research Methodology ............................................................. 79
  6.1 Introduction ............................................................................................... 79
  6.2 Methodological Approaches Used in the Past in Similar Research ......... 79
  6.3 Aim and Objectives .................................................................................. 82
  6.4 Research Paradigm ................................................................................... 83
  6.5 Methodological Approaches ................................................................. 85
    6.5.1 Qualitative and Quantitative Research ........................................... 85
    6.5.2 Qualitative Methodological Considerations .................................... 88
    6.5.3 Case Study Research ......................................................................... 89
    6.5.4 Interviews .......................................................................................... 92
    6.5.5 The Interview Checklist ................................................................. 94
    6.5.6 The Sampling Issues ....................................................................... 95
Chapter 7: Research Findings and Discussion: Resource and Network Bases of Power …
………………………………………………………………………………………………………114
7.1 Introduction ........................................................................................................114
7.2 Analysis of Primary Data ..................................................................................114
7.3 Tourism Stakeholder Network in Agra ...............................................................116
7.4 Analysis of Tourism Stakeholder Resources and Power Relationships ..........121
  7.4.1 Land as a Resource ......................................................................................124
  7.4.2 Labour Force as a Resource .......................................................................130
  7.4.3 Capital as a Resource .................................................................................139
  7.4.4 Knowledge as a Resource .........................................................................143
  7.4.5 Access to Clients as a Resource .................................................................150
7.5 Tourism Resources: Lass Generic and Organisation Specific Ones ...............156
7.6 The Comprehension of Resource-based Power in Agra Tourism Industry .......157
  7.6.1 Power of Individual Businesses ................................................................159
  7.6.2 Power of Ancillary Services Stakeholders .................................................162
  7.6.3 Power of the Authorities ............................................................................163
7.7 The Comprehension of Network-based Power in Agra Tourism Industry .......164
  7.7.1 Power of Agents .........................................................................................165
  7.7.2 Power of Groups .......................................................................................167
7.8 Chapter Summary ...............................................................................................172

Chapter 8: Research Findings and Discussion: Legitimacy ..............................173
8.1 Introduction .......................................................................................................173
8.2 Analyses of Legitimate Bases of Power ...........................................................173
  8.2.1 Straightforward Legal Power .....................................................................176
  8.2.2 Social/Institutional Legitimacy .................................................................177
Chapter 9: Research Findings and Discussion: Urgency 

9.1 Introduction

9.2 Analysis of Stakeholder Relationship Attribute Urgency

9.3 Stakeholder Relationship Attributes in Action in the Agra Tourism Industry

9.3.1 Case One

9.3.1.1 The Taj Ticket Price Row

9.3.1.2 The Role of Urgency in Handling the Issue by Both the Association and the Guild

9.3.2 Case Two

9.3.2.1 Coach Drop-off Point Conflict

9.3.2.2 The Role of Urgency in Handling the Issue by Both the Association and the Guild

9.3.3 Case Three

9.3.3.1 The Airport Issue

9.3.3.2 The Role of Urgency in Handling the Issue by Both the Association and the Guild

9.3.4 Case Four

9.3.4.1 The Shortage of Tour Guides in Agra

9.3.4.2 The Role of Urgency in Handling the Issue by Both the Association and the Guild

9.4 Stakeholder Relationship Framework to Explain Effective Power

9.5 Limitations of the Framework

9.6 Chapter Summary

Chapter 10: Conclusion

10.1 Introduction

10.2 Evaluations of the Research

10.2.1 Objective One

10.2.2 Objective Two

10.2.3 Objective Three

10.2.4 Objective Four
10.2.5 Objective Five ................................................................. 220
10.3 Benefits, Implications and Contribution to the Body of Knowledge .............. 226
10.4 Limitations of the Research ........................................................................ 233
10.5 Areas for further Research ........................................................................ 236
10.6 Chapter Summary ......................................................................................... 238

Bibliography ........................................................................................................ 239

Appendices ........................................................................................................... 270
Appendix 1 ............................................................................................................ 271
Appendix 2 ............................................................................................................. 273
## List of tables

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Table</th>
<th>Title</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Table: 1.1.</td>
<td>The Important Theories and Concepts Used in this Research</td>
<td>4</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 4.1.</td>
<td>Principles of Corporate Social Responsibility</td>
<td>59</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 6.1.</td>
<td>The Paradigm Chart</td>
<td>84</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 6.2.</td>
<td>Qualitative and Quantitative Approaches to Research</td>
<td>86</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 6.3.</td>
<td>Six Sources of Evidence: Strengths and Weaknesses</td>
<td>91</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 6.4.</td>
<td>Comparison of Differing Views of the Tasks of Data Analysis</td>
<td>104</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 9.1.</td>
<td>The Capacity of the Association and the Guild</td>
<td>194</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 9.2.</td>
<td>The Analysis of Stakeholder Relationship Attribute- Urgency in Respect to the Taj Ticket Price Conflict</td>
<td>199</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 9.3.</td>
<td>The Analysis of Stakeholder Relationship Attribute- Urgency in Respect to the Coach Drop-off Point Issue in Agra</td>
<td>202</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 9.4.</td>
<td>Capacity of the Tourism Businesses (the Association and the Guild), and the Government in Agra</td>
<td>203</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 9.5.</td>
<td>The Analysis of Stakeholder Relationship Attribute- Urgency in Respect to the Airport Issue in Agra</td>
<td>206</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Table: 9.6.</td>
<td>The Analysis of Stakeholder Relationship Attribute- Urgency in Respect to the Tour Guide Issue in Agra</td>
<td>208</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
List of figures

Figure: 1.1. The Research Process .................................................................9
Figure: 3.1. Network Structures: Patterns of Relationships ...........................44
Figure: 4.1. Keyboard Analogy of International Strategies and Five Modes of
            Entry into Market .................................................................53
Figure: 4.2. Stakeholder Relationship Attributes ........................................61
Figure: 4.3. The Interaction of Stakeholder Relationship Attributes ...............63
Figure: 4.4. The Conceptual Framework of the Research .............................65
Figure: 5.1. Agra, Uttar Pradesh, India .....................................................70
Figure: 5.2. The Tourist Map of Agra city ..................................................72
Figure: 5.3. The Taj Mahal, Agra, India ......................................................73
Figure: 5.4. Organisations that can Actively Influence the Operation of the Taj 76
Figure: 6.1. Synopsis of the Chosen Methodological Approach .......................98
Figure: 6.2. Components of Data Analysis: Interactive Model ......................107
Figure: 6.3. Examples of Research Themes ...............................................109
Figure: 7.1. Macro Tourism Network (Performance and Support) in Agra .......118
Figure: 7.2. Formal Communication/Interaction of Key
            Stakeholders in Tourism in Agra .............................................120
Figure: 7.3. Key Themes of Resources in Agra Tourism Industry ...................123
Figure: 7.4. Resource-based Power ..........................................................159
Figure: 7.5. Network-based Power ............................................................165
Figure: 7.6. Power Relationship Attributes ..............................................171
Figure: 8.1. Stakeholder Legitimacy Relationships ......................................175
Figure: 9.1. Urgency, Stakeholder Relationship Attributes .........................190
Figure: 9.2. The Taj Ticket Price Issue ......................................................197
Figure: 9.3. The Coach Drop-off Point Issue in Agra ................................201
Figure: 9.4. The Airport Issue in Agra ......................................................205
Figure: 9.5. The Tour Guide Issue in Agra ................................................207
Figure: 9.6. Interactions of Stakeholder Relationship Attributes
            in Creating Effective Power .....................................................211
Figure: 10.1. Stakeholder Relationship Attributes .....................................225
Figure: 10.2. The Methodological Contribution ........................................227
Figure: 10.3. Theoretical and Practical Link of the Research .........................230
List of abbreviations

ADA: Agra Development Authority
ASI: Archaeological Survey of India.
CISF: Central Industrial Security Force
SME: Small and Medium Sized Enterprise
TA: Travel Agent
TG: Tour Guide
TO: Tour Operator
UNESCO: United Nations Economic, Social and Cultural Organisation
UNWTO: United Nation World Tourism Organisation
WTO: World Tourism Organisation
Acknowledgements

The successful completion of this thesis has involved many people. I would like to convey my deepest gratitude to Mike Morgan and Professor John Fletcher who supervised my work. I would also like to acknowledge the generous support of Dr. Keith Wilkes, without which I could not have completed my research. My special thanks go to Chris Hall and Professor Alan Fyall for their contribution to my study. I am thankful to my colleagues at Bournemouth University including Dr. Dorothy Fox, Debbie Sadd and Dr. Yeganeh Morakabati for their time and patience towards the completion of my research. I sincerely thank Bournemouth University especially, the School of Tourism for providing me with the opportunity to study this area.

This study could not have taken place without the participants in Agra giving up their time to take part in interviews. Though they remain anonymous their contribution is highly valued.

Finally, I would like to thank my parents and my sister for their immense support. Very special thanks to my uncle and aunt in Watford for their encouragement without which I could not have completed my research.