1	TITLE: USING SPRINGBOK (ANTIDORCAS) DIETARY PROXIES TO RECONSTRUCT INFERRED
2	PALAEOVEGETATIONAL CHANGES OVER 2 MILLION YEARS IN SOUTHERN AFRICA
3	
4	RUNNING TITLE: Dietary palaeoecology of Plio-Pleistocene Antidorcas
5	
6	AUTHORS: Sewell, L. <sup>1</sup> , Merceron, G. <sup>2</sup> , Hopley, P.J. <sup>3</sup> , Zipfel, B. <sup>4</sup> , and Reynolds, S.C. <sup>1</sup>
7	<sup>1</sup> Institute for Studies in Landscape and Human Evolution, Department of Archaeology,
8	Anthropology and Forensic Science, Bournemouth University, Fern Barrow, Poole, Dorset, UK.
9	<sup>2</sup> Laboratoire de Paléontologie, Évolution, Paléoécosystèmes, Paléoprimatologie (PALEVOPRIM; ex-
10	iPHEP) – UMR 7262 CNRS & Université de Poitiers - 86073 POITIERS CEDEX 9 – FRANCE.
11	<sup>3</sup> Department of Earth and Planetary Sciences, Birkbeck College, University of London, Malet
12	Street, London, UK. <sup>4</sup> Evolutionary Studies Institute and School of Geosciences, University of the
13	Witwatersrand, Johannesburg, South Africa.
14	
15	Corresponding author: Lauren Sewell; Isewell@bournemouth.ac.uk
16	
17	KEYWORDS: Microwear, Mesowear, Springbok, Isotopes, Cradle of Humankind, Plio-
18	Pleistocene, Sterkfontein, Swartkrans, Dietary paleoecology
19	
20	
21	
22	
23	
24	
25	
26	
27	
28	
29	

30

## 31 **ABSTRACT**:

The reconstruction of past vegetation and climatic conditions of the Cradle of Humankind, 32 33 Gauteng Province, South Africa, has been approached using various proxies (such as micromammals, speleothems, faunal and floral presence and stable carbon isotopes). Elisabeth 34 35 Vrba's seminal studies (1974; 1975) on the fossil record of this region indicated dramatic faunal 36 turnover based on species extinction and speciation data. This turnover was thought to have been driven by increasing aridity and spreading grasslands. These reconstructions however, are 37 continuously being refined and adapted in light of advancing techniques (such as dental 38 39 microwear textural analysis) and terrestrial proxies, such as speleothems.

40 However, more recent studies show varying proportions from wooded towards more grassland-dominated habitats, with the most common reconstruction being the heterogeneous 41 'mosaic' habitat. Here we re-evaluate the findings of a transition from woodland to grassland 42 conditions in the fossil record from Member 4 Sterkfontein to Member 5 Sterkfontein and the 43 deposits of Swartkrans. To approach the palaeovegetation changes through time via a different 44 angle, we focus on the diet of the springbok (genus Antidorcas), represented throughout this 45 temporal period from geological members dating from 2.8-0.8 Ma. We use detailed dietary 46 methods (dental linear measurements, mesowear, microwear, and stable carbon isotope 47 analysis) to explore past changes in diets of springbok that can be used to indicate the 48 prevailing vegetation conditions. Our results presented here broadly agree with previous 49 50 palaeoenvironmental reconstructions, in indicating increased grassland post ca 1.7 Ma, with some suggestion of more heterogeneous habitats for Swartkrans Member 2 (ca 1.65-1.07 Ma). 51 52 We find that there is support for the implementation of a multi-disciplinary approach to produce more accurate and robust reconstructions of past diets and by extension, of 53 54 palaeovegetation conditions, if the selected herbivore species is a mixed-feeder, like the springbok. 55

- 56
- 57
- 58

59

60

61

#### 1. INTRODUCTION:

62 Climatic aridification and spread of grasslands are a key feature of African Plio-Pleistocene environmental changes (e.g. Sepulchre et al. 2006; Segalen et al. 2007; Hopley et al. 2007; 63 deMenocal 2011; Kaya et al. 2018), which are inferred to have caused dramatic habitat changes 64 65 that impacted on our ancestors, as well as other fauna. There is broad agreement, from a range of different palaeoenvironmental proxies, (from climatic proxies such as deMenocal's 66 [1995, 2004] marine sediment sequences to terrestrial habitat proxies such as Avery's [2001] 67 micrommamals analyses, that Africa experienced gradually increasing aridity (Bobe and Eck 68 69 2001; Bobe and Behrensmeyer, 2004; Avery, 2001; deMenocal 1995; 2004 amongst others) and a spread of grasslands through time after 5 Ma, with a resulting radiation in grassland-adapted 70 71 taxa (Vrba 1973, 1985). Yet recent studies cast doubt on this prevailing trend for east Africa (Blumenthal et al. 2017; Kaya et al. 2018), heralding the need to revisit this long-standing 72 hypothesis. 73

An increasing number of hominin species are now known to have been present in the 74 75 southern African region throughout this temporal period: Australopithecus sediba (Berger et al. 76 2010), Australopithecus africanus (Dart 1925; Clarke, 2008) Paranthropus robustus (Broom 1938), Homo habilis (Hughes & Tobias 1977) and Homo erectus/ergaster (Leakey 1960; Kuman 77 78 and Clarke, 2000; Antón et al., 2014). During this time of climate and habitat change, we see 79 the disappearance of Australopithecus and the appearance of Homo and Paranthropus. What role, if any, did climate-driven habitat shifts have in the appearance and extinction of these 80 hominins? Here, we are attempting to use dietary variations in other members of the faunal 81 82 community for insights into wider patterns of vegetation and habitat change.

Within ecological proxies, the diversity of ungulate mammals and notably bovids has been frequently studied (e.g. Vrba 1974; Spencer 1997). Among bovids, the species of the genera *Antidorcas* is continuously present throughout this temporal period of interest in South Africa.

There are several *Antidorcas* species, of which only one remains today, *Antidorcas marsupialis*. Modern springbok are typically arid-adapted, mixed feeders, with a relatively wide 88 habitat tolerance primarily in the more arid areas of south and southwestern Africa; South Africa, Namibia, Botswana and Angola (Lehmann 2015; Castelló 2016). Extant A. marsupialis will 89 graze on young grasses when available, swapping to browse on low shrubs and succulents, 90 91 when young grasses are not available. Springbok can survive without drinking water, as long as 92 their food contains more than 10% water content (Estes 1991). Historic records make mention of the mass migrations of these animals in search of better quality grazing after the rains 93 94 (Skinner and Louw, 1996). Social organization alters according to season, sex and age range of the individual springbok (Skinner & Chimimba 2005). When considering dietary signals from 95 fossil Antidorcas, social and migratory behaviour should be considered to account for the range 96 97 of signals obtained (e.g. Nagy and Knight 1994; Bednekoff and Ritter 1997; Stapelberg, et al. 2008). 98

99 Fossil springbok will henceforth be referred to by genus (i.e. 'Antidorcas'). In the fossil 100 record, there were several Antidorcas species; based on tooth enamel carbon stable isotopes, 101 A. recki, A. australis, A. bondi and A. marsupialis appear to have been mixed feeders to varying 102 degrees, with the exception of A. bondi, which was suggested to have been a specialist grazer 103 (Brink and Lee-Thorp 1992).

104 The earliest species, Antidorcas recki (Schwarz 1932) was presumed to tend towards 105 browsing (Luyt 2001). It is assumed that A. recki is the species from which Antidorcas australis (Hendey & Hendey 1968) and / or Antidorcas marsupialis (Zimmermann 1780) and A. bondi 106 (Cooke & Wells 1951) descends. Antidorcas bondi, had a very specific small body-size and 107 108 specialist dentition (with characteristically small, but very high-crowned, hyposdont teeth) and a unique dietary ecology (based on stable carbon isotope data) that enabled it to exist as part 109 of a grazing succession in southern Africa prior to its extinction at the end of the 110 Pleistocene/early Holocene (Brink 2016; Brink et al. 2013; Brink and Lee-Thorp, 1992). Brink and 111 112 Lee-Thorp (1992) proposed A. bondi to be the smallest member of a grazing succession feeding. on new grass shoots whose growth was stimulated by the regular 'mowing' of grasses by extant 113 and extinct species, such as the giant buffalo (Pelorovis antiquus), giant hartebeest 114 (Megalotragus priscus), large equid (Equus capensis) and the medium-sized hartebeest 115

(*Damaliscus niro*) in a similar way to that proposed for the Serengeti in East Africa by Gwynneand Bell (1968).

The presence and palaeoecology of A. australis as a potentially separate species, or a 118 119 subspecies is debated, but remains unresolved (e.g. Gentry 1978, 1992, 2011; Vrba 1973). 120 Antidorcas australis, was originally described from the Middle Stone Age (MSA) site of Swartklip 121 (Cape Province, South Africa) by Hendey and Hendey (1968) as a transitional form of Antidorcas between the ancestral A. recki and the descendant A. marsupialis, consequently tentatively 122 assigned as a sub-species of Antidorcas marsupialis. A. australis was subsequently elevated by 123 Vrba (1973) to a separate species, supported by Hendey (1974) as a valid taxon, when found 124 125 alongside A. recki. However, Vrba (1976) later doubted this elevation, suggesting A. australis was perhaps only a southern Cape endemic form. Gentry (2010) suspects A. australis and A. 126 127 marsupialis to be synonymous, but not all authors agree (e.g. Klein, 1980; Faith 2014).

128

129 Initially all *Antidorcas* specimens are considered together as '*Antidorcas*' with no prior 130 assumptions based on taxonomy and a second time, distinguishing specimens according to 131 their assigned taxonomic category (see Table 1 and Figure 1).

132 The number of species of Antidorcas in the past is important in understanding the overall 133 function of the palaeoecosystem. If herbivore species can only coexist by species 'packing' into narrow niche spaces to reduce competition (e.g. Richie & Olff 1999; Codron et al., 2008) then 134 we should see that A. australis possesses indications of a distinct dietary niche, and or/ 135 different body sizes compared to other Antidorcas congeners. Can dietary signals from dental 136 specimens of proposed Antidorcas australis, combined with contemporaneous Antidorcas 137 marsupialis, establish the likelihood from dental and dietary evidence, of Antidorcas australis as 138 139 a separate species?

140

From the dietary indicators of *Antidorcas*, we establish a broad palaoevegetation reconstruction. One way to reconstruct palaeovegetation cover would be to examine direct evidence of the plants themselves (fossil plants, pollen and phytoliths) preserved at sites like Sterkfontein and Swartkrans, Cradle of Humankind, Gauteng Province, South Africa. However, since plant fossils and pollen are not commonly preserved in the Cradle of Humankind sites (but see Bamford, 1999), we use the dietary evidence from a mixed feeding herbivore that is commonly preserved at these sites, and one which is relatively abundant. Herbivores are considered faithful reflectors of prevailing habitat conditions, over decades of detailed palaeoenvironmental research that used various aspects of herbivore palaeoecology (Vrba 1974, 1975; Plummer and Bishop 1994; Spencer 1997; Reed, 1997; Bobe and Eck, 2001; amongst many others).

A key transition in the southern African fossil record is between Sterkfontein Member 4 152 (where Australopithecus africanus is abundant) and Member 5 (where we have no 153 154 Australopithecus, but instead Homo and Paranthropus). The typical palaeoenvironmental story is one of wetter woodland and closed habitats up to and including Sterkfontein Member 4 (c. 155 2.8-2.0 Ma), with the area becoming more open with drier, grassland-dominated habitats by 156 Sterkfontein Member 5 times which overlap with Swartkrans Members (2-0.8 Ma) (Bamford, 157 1999; Kuman and Clarke 2000; Luyt 2001). Mosaic habitats (Brophy 2011; Reynolds et al. 2015) 158 159 and local variations have been reported between the sites lying within the Cradle of 160 Humankind, presumably due to the varying proximity to the Blaaubank River (Avery 2001; 161 Reynolds and Kibii, 2011). The cave stratigraphy and dating of these South African deposits 162 have received much attention (e.g. Hopley and Maslin 2010; de Ruiter et al. 2008) and a summary of the dates of the deposits are provided in Table 2. There are very few genera of 163 herbivores that occur in both Member 4 and Member 5; which is chiefly characterized by a 164 dramatic turnover in species (e.g. Vrba 1974, 1975; deRuiter, 2003a, b; Reynolds and Kibii, 165 2011). We focus on the only single and successful lineage that is present in Member 4 (as 166 167 Antidorcas recki) and in later Member 5 (as A. marsupialis)

The majority of previous studies typically employ only one or two methods (e.g microwear and/ or stable isotope analyis) to tackle aspects of palaeoenvironmental questions. Each method reveals important aspects relevant to the overall palaeoenvironmental picture, but these methods also have inherent limitations. For example, microwear indicates primarily the last few weeks as new micrometric marks occur after each meal eaten (Teaford & Oyen 1989), mesowear requires observer experience and therefore large sample sizes to mitigate for

this (Kaiser & Fortelius 2003), and isotopes are informative only of a short window in the early 174 175 years of life during enamel formation (Reade et al. 2015). Comparisons between species are 176 also complicated by tooth development varying inter-specifically (Reade et al. 2015). There is, 177 therefore, support for a multi-disciplinary approach to produce more holistic, accurate and robust reconstructions of past diets (Schubert et al. 2006) and by extension, of 178 179 palaeovegetation. Consequently, we take a multi-method approach here to understand when, and how, each method can be used. Our palaeoenvironmental picture obtained from 180 measurements of dental molars, mesowear and microwear analyses, along with new stable 181 isotope data (collected by SCR and PJH in 2002) are compared to the palaeoenvironmental 182 183 signals gained from stable isotope analysis by Lee-Thorp *et al.* (2007).

In this paper, we report on our findings from each method; these methods are typical of much of the current research in palaeoanthropology. The results presented are a subset of results for the wider project underway, used here to reflect on the accuracy and limitations of each method. We use these datasets to address two main questions: 1) can palaeodietary information be used to reconstruct habitat conditions through time; and 2) what additional detail can we gain about the dietary differences between the different *Antidorcas* species in the fossil record?

191

## 192 2. MATERIALS AND METHODS

193 2.1 MATERIALS

A sample of 287 fossil *Antidorcas* teeth from Sterkfontein and Swartkrans, Cradle of Humankind, Gauteng Province, South Africa were examined for this study. All species of *Antidorcas* present in the deposits are considered. Specimens are taxonomically identified following the criteria set out in Table 1.



Figure 1: Examples of *Antidorcas* maxillary (upper) dentition. All photographs taken by L. Sewell
unless otherwise stated\*. A-B: *Antidorcas recki* (A=KA2610; B=KNM-ER 6-18), C-E: *Antidorcas australis* as identified by Vrba (1973): C=SK 3055; D and E=SK 2115), F-H: *Antidorcas bondi* (F=SF
592; G=KA 2472; H=SK 2366), I: modern *Antidorcas marsupiualis*. [Key: KA= Kromdraai, KNMER=Kenya National Museum-East Rudolph [\*photograph by Lucile Crété], SK= Swartkrans, SF=
Sterkfontein]. Scale bars equal 10mm.

207 Modern springbok specimens were also examined (n=33 individuals). Only permanent upper 208 and lower second molars (M<sup>2</sup> and M<sub>2</sub>) were selected for study in the first instance. Where 209 unavailable, permanent upper and lower first or third molars are used for use-wear analyses 210 instead. Substitutions of the permanent molar teeth have been shown to produce comparable 211 dietary signals (Scott 2012; Ramdarshan et al. 2017 for dental microwear textural analysis, and 212 Kaiser & Solounias 2003 for dental mesowear analysis, respectively). Upper and lower second 213 molar were separated for metric (linear dental measurements) analyses.

All statistical analyses were run in software package SPSS (v.23). All results presented here are used to showcase particular aspects of each methodology, highlighting where each method can be implemented to obtain the most accurate results. All data are rank transformed prior to analysis to mitigate for small and varying sample sizes.

218

Species	Antidorcas bondi	Antidorcas recki	Antidorcas marsupialis	Antidorcas cf. australis
Reference	Cooke & Wells 1951	Schwarz 1932	Zimmermann 1780	Hendey & Hendey 1968
Figure	See Figure 1, Images F-H	See Figure 1, Images A-B	See Figure 1, Image I	See Figure 1, Images C-E
Characteristic dental features	<ul> <li>Upper: Strongly developed styles (are often basally (i.e. towards the body of the tooth) pinched, giving a more prominent impression).</li> <li>Upper: Complicated folding of enamel walls of central cavities, with a greater tendency towards dumbbell-shaped central cavities and increased curvature</li> <li>Extreme hypsodonty</li> <li>Lower: a depression runs from occlusal surface to root between lingual molar lobes. Adjacent to these depressions the molar walls appear to "bow out", giving the whole lingual molar edge a wavy look (more similar to impala than the other <i>Antidorcas</i> species).</li> <li>Lower: Sometimes present: lingual "rib" (metastylid) in the or depression between molar lobes.</li> <li>Lower: Central cavities are centrally constricted, creating a dumbbell appearance.</li> <li>Large M<sub>3</sub> metastyle.</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Unbent central cavities</li> <li>Straight mandibular lingual molar face</li> <li>Buccal lophs are V-shaped (more so than the more rounded ones of <i>A. marsupialis</i>)</li> <li>Has styles on upper molars, which are more often V-shaped</li> <li>Upper: Less strongly pronounced concave posterior part of lateral wall (than in <i>A. marsupialis/ A. bondi</i>).</li> <li>Upper: Stronger styles than <i>A. marsupialis</i>, with a flatter and even concave wall between mesostyle and metastyle.</li> <li>P<sub>2</sub> is usually retained (sometimes absent).</li> <li>Lower: Central cavities straighten in relatively early wear stages.</li> <li>Large M<sub>3</sub> metastyle.</li> <li>Typically Retains PM<sub>2</sub></li> <li>PM<sub>3</sub> is larger and more complex than in <i>A. marsupialis</i>.</li> <li>Upper: concave labial walls</li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Lower: Lingual walls are straight (less outwardly bowed than in the impala).</li> <li>Lower: Central cavities straighten in relatively early wear stages</li> <li>Large M<sub>3</sub> metastyle, with noticeably enlarge third (hypoconulid) lobes</li> <li>Lacks PM<sub>2</sub></li> <li>Reduced PM<sub>3</sub></li> </ul>	<ul> <li>Molars are bucco-lingually narrower in mesiodistal length (Vrba 1973) than A. <i>marsupialis</i> (Vrba 1970)</li> <li>Lower: Central cavities straighten in relatively early wear stages</li> <li>Large M<sub>3</sub> metastyle.</li> <li>Lacks PM<sub>2</sub></li> <li>Reduced PM<sub>3</sub></li> <li>Narrower than <i>A. marsupialis</i> and appear more gracile (Vrba 1970)</li> </ul>

Mean I dimensions	<b>M<sup>2 1</sup>16mmx9mm</b>	<sup>2</sup> 13.3mmx6.3mm	<sup>3</sup> 17.4mm(Female)18mm (Male)x 10.9mm	<sup>4</sup> 12.5mmx7.95mm
	other <i>Antidorcas</i> species.			
	size than is the case in			
	thicker with respect to tooth			
	cavities typically appear			
	those surrounding central			
	enamel walls especially			
	present.			
	propont			
	Lower: Occasionally goat     foldo/boool pilloro			
	other Antidorcas species.			
	front), than is the case in the			
	approaches the lobe in			
	anterior part of the lobe			
	'squaring'-where the			
	generally more pointed (less			
	Lower: Buccal lobes are			
	marsupialis.			
	complex than in A.			
	<ul> <li>PM<sub>2</sub> is larger and more</li> </ul>	bening their mesostyles		
	Typically Retains PM	behind their mesostyles		

Table 1: Features typical of each Antidorcas species found in Southern Africa, used to aid in species identification of fossil dentition. 220 Characteristic features used to establish taxonomic assignment of fossil dental specimens (Vrba 1973; Cooke & Wells 1951; Gentry 221 2011, 2010). Typical M<sup>2</sup> dimensions established according to the type specimens, from corresponding reference as stated in the 222 table. <sup>1</sup> Cooke & Wells 1951; dimensions written as length x breadth (in mm). <sup>2</sup> mesiodistal length x bucco-lingual width. Based on 223 mean measurements taken of A. recki from Sterkfontein and Swartkrans by L.Sewell (2016). <sup>3</sup>Vrba 1970; mesiodistal length taken 224 from the mesial surface of the parastyle to the distal surface of the metastyle x mean value from modern A. marsupialis 225 specimens(measured by LCS).<sup>4</sup> Based on mean measurements (by L.Sewell and Vrba 1973) of specimens assigned to A.australis; 226 227 mesiodistal length x buccolingual width.

COLLECTIONS USED: Sterkfontein Member 4 and 5 (Stw53 Infill, East and West), Swartkrans Member 1 (Lower Bank and Hanging
 Remnant), Member 2 and Member 3. Fossil collections are housed at the Evolutionary Studies Institute (ESI), University of the
 Witwatersrand, Johannesburg and the Ditsong Museum of Natural History (DM), Pretoria, South Africa. Additional material from
 modern Mammalogy collections (wild caught) was studied to establish the anticipated range of variation. Modern collections are
 housed at the Natural History Museum (NHM), London and the National Museums Scotland (NMS), Edinburgh, United Kingdom and
 the Ditsong Museum of Natural History, Pretoria, South Africa.
 Additional modern collections were used for dental microwear textural analysis (DMTA). In addition to NHM and NMS, the following

institutions' collections were used: MNHM Paris, France; Zoologisches Museum Berlin, Germany; Staatliches Museum für
 Naturkunde of Stuttgart, Germany; Senckenberg Naturkundemuseum of Frankfurt, Germany; NHM Basel, Switzerland.

237

Member	Date	Method	Reference
Sterkfontein Member 4	2.8-2.4 Ma	Bovid biochronology	Vrba 1976, 1980
	~2.5 Ma	Primate biochronology	Delson 1984, 1988
	2.8-2.6 Ma	Mammalian biochronology	Mckee 1993
	~2.1 Ma	ESR (electron spin resonance)	
		Palaeomagnetism	Schwarcz et al. 1994
	2.15-2.14 Ma	Uranium-lead	
	2.65-2.01 Ma	ESR, and palaeomagnetism	Partridge 2005
			Pickering and Kramers 2010
	2.8-~2.0 Ma		Herries and Shaw 2011
Date range: 2.8-2.0 Ma.			
Sterkfontein Stw infill	2.6-2.0 Ma	Biochronology	Kuman and Clarke 2000
	1.8-1.4 Ma	Biostratigraphy	Herries et al. 2009
	1.8-1.5 Ma	ESR and palaeomagnetism	Herries and Shaw 2011
	Date range: 2.6-1.4 Ma.		
Sterkfontein M5 East	2.0-1.7 Ma	Biochronology and archaeology	Kuman and Clarke 2000
		Dating seriation	
	1.4-1.1 Ma	ESR, isotopes and	Herries et al. 2009
	1.4-1.2 Ma	palaeomagnetism	Herries and Shaw 2011

Date range: 2.0-1.1 Ma.

Sterkfontein M5 West	1.7-1.4 Ma	Biochronology and archaeology Dating seriation	Kuman and Clarke 2000			
	1.3-0.8 Ma	ESR and palaeomagnetism	Herries et al. 2009			
	1.3-1.1 Ma		Herries and Shaw 2011			
Date range: 1.7-0.8 Ma.						
Swartkrans Member 1 LB	1.7 Ma	Biostratigraphy	Vrba 1985; Churcher and Watson 1993; de Ruiter 2003a,b;			
	1.8 Ma	Biostratigraphy	Brain 1995, Vrba 2000			
Swartkrans Member 1 HR	1.6 Ma	Biostratigraphy	Vrba 1982, 1985; Delson 1984;			
			Ruiter 2003a.b			
Swartkrans Member 1	2.0-1.4 Ma	ESR	Curnoe et al. 2001			
(combined)	2.0 (±0.02) Ma	(±0.02) Ma U-Pb boyid enamel dating				
Ϋ́ Υ	Date range: 2.0-1.4 Ma.	5				
Swartkrans Member 2	1.36 (±0.29)Ma (1.65-1.07 Ma)	U-Pb enamel dating	Balter et al. 2008			
	1.44±0.05	U-Pb enamel dating	Albarede et al. 2006			
	1.7-1.1 Ma	Biochronology	Brain 1995; Vrba 1995a,b: Herries			
		Dating seriation	et al. 2009			
Date range: 1.7-1.07 Ma.						
Swartkrans Member 3	0.83(±0.21)Ma (1.04-0.61 Ma)	U-Pb enamel dating	Balter et al. 2008			
	0.988±0.003					
	1.5-0.7 Ma	U-Pb enamel dating	Albarede et al. 2006			
		Biochronology	Brain 1993; Vrba 1995a,b; Herries			
			et al. 2009			
Date range: 1.5-0.61 Ma.						

TABLE 2. Dates ranges and methods used to obtain these dates for each member used. Maximum date ranges are indicated below

each Member row. Member deposits ordered chronologically relative to one another (oldest to youngest) based on the datesprovided in the table.

241

242 2.2. METHODS

Due to the uncertainty surrounding the taxonomic status of *A. australis*, (according to features in Table 1), *A.australis* and *A.marsupialis* fossil specimens were analysed together under '*Antidorcas* sp.'

Other species of specific dietary preference, such as the grazing blesbok (*Damaliscus pygargus /dorcas*) are occasionally used to establish the fossil dietary parameters and understand the dietary signals gained from *Antidorcas*.

249

### 250 **2.2.1 Linear Measurements of Teeth**

Tooth dimensions obtained from measurements of mesiodistal length (MDL) and bucco-lingual width (BLW) are considered for this study. Measurements were taken in millimeters with carbon fiber composites digital calipers (resolution: 0.1mm/0.001").

254

#### 255 **2.2.2. Mesowear**

256 Mesowear provides an indication of an individual's dietary signal through their lifetime. Mesowear scores are informative on the abrasiveness of the diet and can be used as a 257 258 reflection of the grazing/browsing composition of diet. Grazers' molars typically exhibit low 259 occlusal relief and blunter cusps due to the abrasive nature of a predominantly grazing diet. 260 Browsers on the other hand, normally display higher occlusal relief, typically with sharper cusps (Fortelius and Solounias 2000). Following the protocol established by Fortelius and Solounias 261 262 (2000), numerical values are given to each tooth based on occlusal relief (High or Low) and cusp shape (Sharp, rounded or blunt) as set out in Figure 2. The numerical value (score) is given as 263 264 follows: Low Blunt:0, Low Rounded:1, Low sharp:2, High rounded:3, High sharp:4. Upper molars 265 are used for mesowear analysis as lower molars have a tendency towards blunting and are 266 consequently likely to be exhibiting a predominance of grazing signals (Kaiser and Fortlius 2003). 267

Frat	$\wedge \wedge$	Steep valley between cusps	HIGH Occlusal Relief	
	$\sim$	Shallow valley between cusps	LOW Occlusal Relief	
		Sharp cusps	SHARP Cusp Shape	
To		Rounded cusps	ROUNDED Cusp Shape	
		No distinct facets	BLUNT Cusp Shape	

268

FIGURE 2: Mesowear scoring figure: Traditional mesowear scoring system, established by
 Fortelius and Solounias (2000), figure modified from Merceron et al. (2007).

## 272 2.2.3. Dental Microwear Textural Analysis (DMTA)

Dental microwear textures provide insight into the diet over the last few weeks/days of an 273 individual animal's lifetime (Teaford & Oyen 1989; Schulz et al. 2013; Merceron et al. 2016; 274 275 Ramdarshan et al. 2016). Upper and lower molars were used for microwear analysis to allow 276 direct comparisons across species and deposits. Because values from all positions (M1 to M3) of 277 permanent molars can be used together in statistical analysis as their dental microwear 278 textures have been shown to be statistically similar (see Ramdarshan et al. 2017). Data on 279 lower molars can be grouped with upper molars if specific facets are considered (see below; see 280 Ramdarshan et al. 2017). This is beneficial when dealing with isolated fossil dentition that may 281 not be as clearly identifiable to a particular tooth.

282

283 Dental microwear texture analysis (DMTA) was conducted according to Merceron et al. (2016).

284 Molds of the dental enamel facets of interest, on the disto-buccal facets of the protoconid (or

285 on the hypoconid if the former facet is broken), and on mesio-lingual facets of the protocone (Figure 3), were created using polyvinvylsiloxane elastomer. Ramdarshan et al. (2017) have 286 287 shown that there are significant differences in dental microwear textures between the disto-288 buccal facets of the protoconid on lower teeth and the lingual facet of the paracone on upper; 289 but not with the protocone from upper molars (see discussion in Ramdarshan et al. 2017). This 290 mold is cut to provide a relatively small and flat surface, for viewing under the surface 291 profilometer (Leica DCM8 confocal profilometer). The prepared molds are placed under a Leica 292 DCM8 confocal profilometer using white light confocal technology with a Leica 100x objective (Numerical aperture = 0.90; working distance = 0.9 mm). The lateral resolution is an (x, y)293 294 interval of 0.129 µm, with a vertical numerical step of 1 nm. Scans are taken in the centre of the facet, where possible, to ensure repeatability and to limit subjectivity. Scans are treated using 295 LeicaMap to eliminate artefacts, such as abnormal peaks following procedures detailed in the 296 supplementary material in Merceron et al. (2016). Data analyses for DMTA are run through 297 Sfrax and Toothfrax software, as set out by Scott et al. (2006). 298



299

FIGURE 3: DMTA image: Dental microwear texture analysis is run on the disto-buccal facets of
 the buccal cuspids along the lower arch (modified from Merceron et al. 2016).

Complexity (Area-scale fractal complexity, *Asfc*) measures the roughness of the dental facet surface. Scale of maximum complexity (*Smc*) shows the scale range *Asfc* is calculated from (taking the steepest part of the relative area against the scale of the curve). Anisotropy considers the direction of wear and relative lengths of vectors (depth profiles), essentially providing a view of direction of wear and a glimpse into heterogeneity (Scott et al. 2006). Multiple scratches with no pitting would produce anisotropic surfaces with a high *epLsar* value, 309 whereas a surface with scratches in opposing directions coupled with pits of varying depths and 310 sizes would produce a complex (high Asfc) and isotropic (low epLsar) surface and be more 311 indicative of browsing diets (Scott et al. 2012, 2006). Homogeneity of wear is provided through 312 HAsfc values (Heterogeneity of Area-scale fractal analysis). Higher HAsfc values indicate greater variation in diet. Homogeneity of diet tends to show in homogeneity of surface texture (i.e. 313 lower HAsfc values) (Scott et al. 2006). HAsfc are calculated through a 9- and an 81-cell mesh 314 over each scanned surface. Tfv (Textural fill volume) values represent the surface texture based 315 on fill volume at different scales (i.e. the relief of the surface) (Scott et al. 2006). Considerable 316 research has focused on the nature of microwear signatures in whether dust and grit cloud the 317 318 dietary signals obtained. Ungar et al. (2016) and Merceron et al. (2016) show that overall, microwear data is informative of dietary preferences and thus, in this case also informative 319 320 about palaeovegetation.

321

Data are rank transformed and a one-way ANOVA with post-hoc Tukey's HSD and Fisher's LSD tests are performed, once to establish species dietary differences and a second time, to understand dietary differences (for all *Antidorcas* species combined) between members.

325

## 326 **2.2.4. Stable carbon isotope analysis**

Stable carbon isotope analysis was made possible via temporary export and destructive 327 sampling permits granted by SAHRA (South African Heritage Resource Agency). Stable carbon 328 329 isotope values provide a dietary signal from the early years of an individual animal's lifetime. The carbon values are reflective of the  $C_3/C_4$  composition of the diet during the time of dental-330 331 enamel formation. Carbon isotopes indicate the photosynthetic pathways used by the vegetation and subsequently consumed by the animal sampled. C<sub>3</sub> plants (indicative of a 332 predominantly browsing diet) are more depleted in carbon ( $\delta^{13}$ C) than C<sub>4</sub> plants (indicative of a 333 334 predominantly grazing diet) (Vogel 1978; Luyt 2001). Isotope analysis complements use-wear (mesowear and microwear) analysis. Isotopes contrast with microwear (meals of last days to 335 336 weeks) and mesowear (averaged lifetime) results, by providing the early years (during dental 337 enamel formation) signal. To obtain the isotopic information, approximately 5-10 mg of enamel powder was extracted from each tooth using a diamond-tipped drill bit, as a bulk sample. Samples were then cleaned using standard pre-treatment methods for the removal of organic and carbonate contaminants (Lee-Thorp et al. 1997; van der Merwe et al. 2003). Carbon and oxygen isotopic measurements were obtained using a VG SIRA 12 mass spectrometer at the University of Liverpool (see Hopley et al., 2006 for further details). Long-term laboratory reproducibility ( $\sigma$ ) is better than ± 0.1 ‰ for both isotope ratios.

344

## **3**45 **3. RESULTS:**

346 3.1. LINEAR MEASUREMENTS OF TEETH

347 Modern springbok are sexually dimorphic, with males having larger body size and larger, more robust horn sizes (e.g., Skinner and Chimimba 2005; Brakora 2014). To rule out sexual 348 dimorphism, we tested modern Antidorcas data (of known sex) for significant differences in 349 MDL and BLW measurements. No significant differences were found (Mann-Whitney U test 350 P>0.05 for occlusal length; P>0.05 for bucco-lingual width). These results show that male and 351 352 female springbok teeth do not differ significantly in size. Consequently, we consider that sexual 353 dimorphism in the fossil species is unlikely to confound the potential size differences where 354 they are observed in the fossil record.

Both *A. recki* and *A. bondi* can clearly be distinguished from *A. marsupialis* based on their consistently smaller size (Table 3). In contrast, there is considerable overlap between specimens previously assigned to *Antidorcas australis* (Vrba 1973) compared to those assigned to *Antidorcas marsupialis*. For example, in Swartkrans Member 1, the bucco-lingual width of *A. australis* (n=10) ranges from 4.5-12.5mm and *A. marsupialis* (n=3) ranges from 5.5-10.2mm.

360

Species	Provenance	Ν	Mean MDL	Mean BLW
Antidorcas	Swartkrans	3	14.1	9.6
marsupialis/australis	Member 1			
	Swartkrans	1	14.7	9.4
	Member 2			
	Swartkrans	22	14.8	9.4
	Member 3			
	Cave of Hearths	5	15.0	11.3
Antidorcas	Modern	44	16.3	11.7

marsupialis				
Antidorcas recki	Sterkfontein Member 4	1	14.7	6.0
	Cooper's Cave (D)	1	14.7	10.4
Antidorcas bondi	Swartkrans Member 2	11	13.9	8.6
	Cave of Hearths	3	15.1	8.5
Antidorcas. sp*	Swartkrans Member 1	1	13.4	10.4
	Swarktrans Member 2	18	14.4	9.8
	Swartkrans Member 3	2	13.1	11.4

Table 3: Mean M<sup>2</sup> measurements for each *Antidorcas* species. Measurements are separated according to deposit (site and Member). MDL=mesiodistal length; BLW=bucco-lingual width. \*In

this table, *Antidorcas* sp. refers to specimens identifiable only to genus level.

364

Statistical analysis of mesiodistal length (MDL) and bucco-lingual width (BLW) showed that 365 366 Antidorcas bondi and Antidorcas sp. are significantly different for Swartkrans Member 2 (MDL 367 p=0.014; BLW p=0.08), perhaps suggesting the presence of another Antidorcas species, other 368 than Antidorcas bondi. BLW significantly increased (Kruskal-Wallis test) from Swartkrans Member 1 to Swartkrans Member 2 for specimens assigned to the following taxa: Antidorcas 369 sp. (p=0.012), A. bondi (p=0.005) and A. marsupialis (p=0.004). These results suggest the 370 presence of two species of Antidorcas in Swartkrans Member 1 and Member 2, both of which 371 exhibit dental size changes through time. Whilst some specimens are identifiable only to genus 372 (Antidorcas sp.), we can assert that the bucco-lingual width increases for the Antidorcas genus 373 374 from Swartkrans Member 1 to Swartkrans Member 2.



376

FIGURE 4: Scatter plot of *Antidorcas* linear measurements. Morphological measurements of permanent A) lower second molars for all members (bucco-lingual width against mesiodistal length) according to species. (*Antidorcas bondi* n=9, *Antidorcas recki* n=5, *Antidorcas* sp. (*A. australis/marsupialis*) n=28, modern *Antidorcas marsupialis* n=36). Modern and fossil *A. marsupalis* and *A. australis* show significant overlap in dimensions. B) upper second molars for all members (bucco-lingual width against mesiodistal length) according to species.

Antidorcas bondi second molar mesiodistal length significantly increases between Swartkrans Member 1 (1.7-1.1 Ma) and Swartkrans Member 2 (0.7-0.6 Ma). The mean mesiodistal length of the sample of *A. bondi* second molars significantly increased (Independent samples Kruskal-Wallis Test (p=0.018), with post-hoc independent samples t-test p=0.038) from Member 1 times (mean length 12.9mm) to Member 2 times (mean length 14.5 mm).

387

#### 388 3.2 MESOWEAR

- 389 Mesowear scores from this study are given in Table 4. There is a good level of agreement with 390 our data and the existing dietary inferences for each species.
- 391 Specifically, the extinct *A. bondi* differs from the modern *A. marsupialis* in having higher 392 frequency of molars with low occlusal relief, together with rounded to blunt cusps. This is 393 suggestive of more grazing dietary habits than the modern forms, as previously stated by Brink 394 and Lee-Thorp (1992). Although low in sample size, *A. recki* exhibits a primarily browsing 395 mesowear signature of high relief, with sharp cusps, thus supporting previous isotopic results 396 by Luyt (2001) and other studies of postcranial ecomorphology of this species from Olduvai 397 Gorge, Tanzania (Plummer and Bishop, 1994).

A: Species	Ν	% High	% Low	% Sharp	%Rounded	%Blunt
Antidorcas sp.	27	63	37	44	56	0
Antidorcas recki	4	75	25	100	0	0
Antidorcas bondi	58	43	57	43	47	10
Antidorcas marsupialis fossil	42	74	26	48	40	12
Antidorcas marsupialis modern	24	63	38	33	58	8
B: Provenance	Ν	% High	% Low	% Sharp	%Rounded	%Blunt
Sterkfontein (unstratified)	31	48	52	48	42	10
Sterkfontein Member 4	10	60	40	50	50	0
Sterkfontein Member 5 (west)	5	60	40	40	60	0
Swartkrans Member 1 (HR)	4	50	50	25	25	50
Swartkrans Member 1 (LB)	3	100	0	100	0	0
Swartkrans Member 2	22	64	36	36	59	5
Swartkrans Member 3	25	72	28	48	40	12
Cooper's Cave	4	75	25	100	0	0
Cave of Hearths	27	44	56	41	52	7
Modern	24	62.5	37.5	33	58	8

C: Provenance	Species	Ν	% High	% Low	% Sharp	%Rounded	%Blunt
Sterkfontein (unstratified)	Antidorcas sp.	1	100	0	100	0	0
	Antidorcas bondi	25	40	60	52	36	12
Sterkfontein Member 4	Antidorcas sp.	10	60	40	50	50	0
Sterkfontein Member 5 (west)	Antidorcas sp.	5	60	40	40	60	0
Swartkrans Member 1 (HR)	Antidorcas sp.	1	100	0	0	100	0
	Antidorcas marsupialis	3	33	67	33	0	67
Swartkrans Member 1 (LB)	Antidorcas sp.	1	100	0	100	0	0
	Antidorcas marsupialis	2	100	0	100	0	0
Swartkrans Member 2	Antidorcas sp.	9	56	44	33	67	0

	Antidorcas bondi	11	64	36	36	55	9
	Antidorcas marsupialis	2	100	0	50	50	0
Swartkrans Member 3	Antidorcas marsupialis	25	72	28	48	40	12
Cooper's Cave	Antidorcas recki	4	75	25	100	0	0
Cave of Hearths	Antidorcas bondi	22	36	64	36	55	9
	Antidorcas marsupialis	5	80	20	60	40	0
Modern	Antidorcas marsupialis	24	62.5	37.5	33	58	8

400 Table 4: Antidorcas mesowear values. Relief (%high/low) and cusp shape (%sharp, rounded and blunt), 'N' = number of specimens

401 Table A: Mesowear by species, B: Mesowear for all the *Antidorcas* genus through time, (ordered oldest to youngest according to

402 member), C: Mesowear through time, separated for each Antidorcas species. Antidorcas sp. represents Antidorcas identifiable only

403 to genus. 'Antidorcas marsupialis' represents specimens taxonomically assigned to A. australis or A. marsupialis (with the exception

404 of the modern specimens).

# 405 3.3 MICROWEAR

- 406 The dental microwear textures of modern *A. marsupialis* display microwear values expected for
- 407 mixed feeders with medium values in complexity and high values in anisotropy.
- 408 This data shows a wide Asfc and epLsar distribution for fossil Antidorcas also, indicative of
- 409 mixed-feeding dietary habits, similar to modern springbok (Figure 5).

410



411

412 FIGURE 5. Biplots (Asfc on X axis vs epLsar on Y axis) of modern ruminants and extinct species of Antidorcas from South African

413 Cradle of Humankind sites. The two lower plots show overlap, and therefore mixed-feeding signatures, when compared to modern 414 obligate browsing and obligate grazing species.

Spe	cies	Ν		Asfc			epLsar			HAsfc	9	F	Asfc 8	31		TFV2	
			М	SD	SEM	Μ	SD	SEM	Μ	SD	SEM	М	SD	SEM	М	SD	SEM
Fo	Antidorcas sp.	7	4.61	2.79	1.06	0.00585	0.00221	0.00083	0.56	0.14	0.05	0.86	0.26	0.10	72548.6	12914.2	4881.1
ossi	A.bondi	12	6.16	4.05	1.17	0.00479	0.00229	0.00066	0.52	0.34	0.10	0.85	0.44	0.13	63763.9	8943.1	2581.6
_	A.marsupialis/	10	3.98	3.79	1.20	0.00692	0.00395	0.00125	0.47	0.33	0.10	0.75	0.36	0.12	63742.3	12917.9	4085.0
	australis																
	A.recki	5	7.51	4.25	1.90	0.00368	0.00250	0.00112	0.52	0.27	0.12	1.06	0.49	0.22	56845.1	16825.5	7524.6
Modern	Alcelaphus	31	1.59	0.70	0.13	0.00536	0.00183	0.00033	0.34	0.21	0.04	0.59	0.22	0.04	50449.0	8450.2	1517.7
	buselaphus																
	Cephalophus	27	3.50	2.63	0.51	0.00304	0.00173	0.00033	0.34	0.13	0.02	0.61	0.21	0.04	4.0349.2	8450.2	1517.7
	sylvicultor																
	Giraffa	16	1.97	0.91	0.23	0.00217	0.00176	0.00044	0.40	0.33	0.08	0.68	0.49	0.12	27251.7	19050.1	4762.5
	camelopardalis																
	Syncerus caffer	23	1.53	0.84	0.18	0.00456	0.00254	0.00053	0.32	0.19	0.04	0.57	0.28	0.06	46026.2	8556.2	1784.1
	Damaliscus	8	2.38	0.58	0.21	0.00453	0.00308	0.00109	0.56	0.31	0.11	0.90	0.36	0.13	60687.7	7822.0	2765.5
	pygargus																
	Antidorcas	16	3.32	2.40	0.60	0.00733	0.00360	0.00090	0.53	0.32	0.08	1.02	0.64	0.16	63222.4	18965.2	4741.3
	marsupialis																
Tah	le 5° Summary d	lenta	al mic	rowea	r texti	ire narar	neter sta	tistics M	lean l	(M) c	tandar	d dev	iation	(SD) a	nd stand	ard error	of the

Table 5: Summary dental microwear texture parameter statistics. Mean (M), standard deviation (SD) and standard error of the mean (SEM) for all species. *Antidorcas* sp. refers to those identifiable only to genus level.

418

Asfc	df	SS	MS	F	р
Sample	9	118199.2	13133.2	9.91	0.00000
Error	145	192110.8	1324.9		
epLsar					
Sample	9	89219.0	9913.2	6.50	0.00000
Error	145	221091.0	1524.8		
HAsfc 9					
Sample	9	47319.2	5257.7	2.90	0.00350
Error	145	262990.8	1813.7		
HAsfc 81					
Sample	9	61267.8	6807.5	3.96	0.00015
Error	145	249042.2	1717.5		
Tfv2					
Sample	9	164841.0	18315.7	18.26	0.00000
error	145	145469.0	1003.2		

419 Table 6: DMTA Analysis of Variance. One-way ANOVAs on dental microwear textural parameters to explore variations between

420 modern and extinct species of ruminants. df: degrees of freedom, SS: sum of squares, MS: mean of squares.

421

л	2	2
4	z	2

LSD \ HSD tests		Antidorcas bondi	Antidorcas sp	Antidorcas marsupialis	Antidorcas recki	Alcelaphus buselaphus	Cephalophus sylvicultor	Giraffa camelopardalis	Syncerus caffer	Damaliscus pygargus	Antidorcas marsupialis
	Antidorcas bondi	i				asfc		asfc	asfc		
	Antidorcas sp					asfc		asfc	asfc		
Fossii	Antidorcas marsupialis					asfc			asfc		
	Antidorcas recki	i				asfc			asfc		
	Alcelaphus buselaphus	asfc	asfc	asfc	asfc		asfc				asfc
	Cephalophus sylvicultor	-				asfc			asfc		
Manlaus	Giraffa camelopardalis	asfc	asfc	asfc	asfc		asfc				
wodern	Syncerus caffer	asfc	asfc	asfc	asfc		asfc				asfc
	Damaliscus pygargus	asfc				asfc			asfc		
	Antidorcas marsupialis	asfc				asfc			asfc		
	Antidorcas bondi							epLsar			
<b>F</b> ===1	Antidorcas sp	)						epLsar			
Fossii	Antidorcas marsupialis						epLsar	epLsar			
	Antidorcas recki	ī		epLsar							
	Alcelaphus buselaphus						epLsar	epLsar			
	Cephalophus sylvicultor	r epLsar	epLsar	epLsar		epLsar					epLsar
Madam	Giraffa camelopardalis	epLsar	epLsar	epLsar		epLsar			epLsar		epLsar
wodern	Syncerus caffer	-					epLsar	epLsar			
	Damaliscus pygargus							epLsar			
	Antidorcas marsupialis				epLsar		epLsar	epLsar	epLsar	epLsar	
	Antidorcas bondi										
Fasail	Antidorcas sp	)							HAsfc 9		
FUSSI	Antidorcas marsupialis										
	Antidorcas recki	i									
	Alcelaphus buselaphus		HAsfc 9								
	Cephalophus sylvicultor	-	HAsfc 9								
Madam	Giraffa camelopardalis		HAsfc 9								
wodern	Syncerus caffer	HAsfc 9	HAsfc 9								
	Damaliscus pygargus					HAsfc 9		HAsfc 9	HAsfc 9		
	Antidorcas marsupialis					HAsfc 9		HAsfc 9	HAsfc 9		
	Antidorcas bondi										
Fossil	Antidorcas sp	)									
10551	Antidorcas marsupialis										
	Antidorcas recki	i							HAsfc 81		
	Alcelaphus buselaphus		HAsfc 81		HAsfc 81						HAsfc 81
	Cephalophus sylvicultor		HAsfc 81		HAsfc 81						
Modern	Giraffa camelopardalis		HAsfc 81		HAsfc 81						
Modelli	Syncerus caffer	HAsfc 81	HAsfc 81		HAsfc 81						HAsfc 81
	Damaliscus pygargus					HAsfc 81	HAsfc 81	HAsfc 81	HAsfc 81		
	Antidorcas marsupialis					HAsfc 81	HAsfc 81	HAsfc 81	HAsfc 81		
	Antidorcas bondi	i				Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2		
Fossil	Antidorcas sp	1				Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2		
1 0331	Antidorcas marsupialis					Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2		
	Antidorcas recki	i	Tfv2					Tfv2			
	Alcelaphus buselaphus	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2			Tfv2	Tfv2			Tfv2
	Cephalophus sylvicultor	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2				Tfv2	Tfv2
Modern	Giraffa camelopardalis	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2			Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2
Modern	Syncerus caffer	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2			Tfv2	Tfv2		Tfv2	Tfv2
	Damaliscus pygargus					Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2		
1	Antidorcas marsupialis					Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2	Tfv2		

423

424 Table 7. Pairwise differences for microwear texture parameters between modern ruminants and extinct species of Antidorcas from

425 South African fossil sites. Significance at P<0.05 for a given variable is indicated by variable abbreviations below the diagonal for

426 Fisher's LSD tests and above the diagonal for both Tukey's HSD and Fisher's LSD tests (see text for details). Antidorcas sp. represents

427 specimens identifiable only to genus. Fossil 'Antidorcas marsupialis' represents Antidorcas marsupialis/australis.

28

428 As shown in tables 5 and 6, significant differences between species emerge.

Tables 5 and 7 show that all extinct species of *Antidorcas* differ from the modern grazing taxa-*Alcelaphus buselaphus* and *Syncerus caffer*, in having higher *Asfc*. All fossil *Antidorcas* differ from the leaf-browsing *Giraffa camelopardalis*, in having higher *Asfc*. All fossil *Antidorcas*, excluding *A. recki* have higher *epLsar* than the two modern species of browsing ruminants. Finally, all fossil *Antidorcas* species have higher *Tfv* than modern species (except modern springbok; Tables 5 and 7).

- 435
- 436
- 437

Provenance	Ν		Asfc			epLsar		HAsfc 9		HAsfc 81		TFV2				
		М	SD	SEM	Μ	SD	SEM	Μ	SD	SEM	М	SD	SEM	Μ	SD	SEM
Sterkfontein M4	5	7.51	4.25	1.90	0.00368	0.00250	0.00112	0.52	0.27	0.22	1.06	0.49	0.22	56845.1	16825.5	7524.6
Swartkrans M2	12	1.50	3.84	1.11	0.00589	0.00238	0.00069	0.50	0.21	0.06	0.80	0.26	0.07	69556.8	11937.3	3446.0
Swartkrans M3	7	2.80	1.19	0.45	0.00697	0.00336	0.00127	0.41	0.17	0.06	0.70	0.23	0.09	59850.9	12984.3	4907.6
Cave of Hearths	10	6.17	4.28	1.35	0.00482	0.00338	0.00107	0.59	0.43	0.13	0.93	0.53	0.17	65679.1	9409.6	2975.6
Modern	16	3.32	2.40	0.60	0.00733	0.00360	0.00090	0.53	0.32	0.08	1.02	0.64	0.16	63222.4	18965.2	4741.3

438 TABLE 8: Dental microwear textural parameters (mean and standard deviation). All Antidorcas species are pooled together, with

439 fossil Antidorcas separated by provenance (site and Member 'M'), where sufficient sample sizes allowed, to indicate the prevailing

440 trend through time. 'Modern' represents the modern *Antidorcas marsupialis* sample.

4	4	1

Asfc	df	SS	MS	F	р
Sample	4	15620.9	3905.2	1.42	0.242
Error	45	123612.4	2746.9		
epLsar					
Sample	4	27589.5	6897.4	2.02	0.107
Error	45	153388.5	3408.6		
HAsfc 9					
Sample	4	1952.6	488.2	0.15	0.964
Error	45	151665.9	3370.4		
HAsfc 81					
Sample	4	7396.2	1849.1	0.75	0.563
Error	45	110802.2	2462.3		
Tfv2					
Sample	4	13843.6	3460.9	1.64	0.181
error	45	94932.1	2109.6		

Table 9: One-way ANOVAs on dental microwear textural parameters to explore variations
between Members (Sterkfontein Member 4, Swartkrans Member 2, Swarktrans Member 3,
Cave of Hearths and Modern springbok). df: degrees of freedom, SS: sum of squares, MS: mean
of squares.

446

As indicated (Table 9), there are no significant differences for *Antidorcas* microwear texture
parameters between Members (through time), suggestive of varying degrees of mixed habitats
being available throughout this temporal period.

450 Considering Table 8, the highest *Asfc* and lowest *epLsar* values for Sterkfontein Member 4 could 451 support the notion of greater woodland in the area, with *Antidorcas* including slightly more 452 browse in the diet, than at Swartkrans (Member 2 and 3).

453

## 454 3.4 STABLE CARBON ISOTOPES

455  $C_3$  plants are more depleted in <sup>13</sup>C relative to  $C_4$  plants (Vogel 1978; O'Leary 1981). Therefore, 456 tooth enamel with higher carbon isotope values is indicative of the consumption of more  $C_4$ 457 plants. We assign each fossil enamel carbon isotope value to the dietary classifications of Lee-458 Thorp et al. (2007); see Tables 10, 11 & 12.

In line with results from the other dietary proxies, Table 11 shows *Antidorcas bondi* was generally eating a very different diet to other *Antidorcas* species and is more in line with 461 *Damaliscus* (grazing) diets (other than during Swartkrans Member 2 times c.1.65-1.07 Ma). The 462 higher mean carbon isotope values of *A. bondi* are indicative of  $C_4$  plants being consumed, 463 suggestive of a grazing and mixed feeding diet (Cerling et al. 1999). Of the 19 fossils classified as 464 *Antidorcas* sp. (Table 8), two specimens (SK 14123 and SK11073) have carbon isotopic 465 compositions consistent with *A. marsupialis*, and can be tentatively assigned to this species; the 466 remaining specimens have higher carbon isotope values and are likely to belong to *A. bondi*.

Dietary category	C3/C4 dominance	δ <sup>13</sup> C	
Grazer	$C_4$	>-3.0‰	
Mixed feeder	$C_3 \& C_4$	<-3.0‰ >-9.0‰	
Browser	$C_3$	<-9.0‰	
	5	40	

468 TABLE 10: Dietary categories according to Stable carbon isotope values. Dietary distinctions according to  $\delta^{13}$ C values and proportion

469 of C3/C4 vegetation dominance in diet. Values from Lee-Thorp et al. (2007).

470

Number	Species	δ <sup>13</sup> C	δ <sup>18</sup> Ο	Member
SK5882	Antidorcas sp.	1.6	-1.5	Swartkrans Member 2
SK5882	Antidorcas sp.	1.8	-0.8	Swartkrans Member 2
SK5990	Antidorcas sp.	-4.8	1.6	Swartkrans Member 2
SK10555	Antidorcas sp.	-1.1	0.1	Swartkrans Member 2
SK10555	Antidorcas sp.	-1.6	0.2	Swartkrans Member 2
SK4064	Antidorcas sp.	-0.6	0.6	Swartkrans Member 2
SK6118	Antidorcas sp.	1.1	0.6	Swartkrans Member 2
SK2264	Antidorcas sp.	-3.8	-0.9	Swartkrans Member 2
SK4083	Antidorcas sp.	-0.4	1.8	Swartkrans Member 2
SK4083	Antidorcas sp.	-0.4	1.5	Swartkrans Member 2
SK4080	Antidorcas sp.	-1.7	0.1	Swartkrans Member 2
SK2292	Antidorcas sp.	-5.9	-1.3	Swartkrans Member 2
SK4633	Antidorcas sp.	-0.6	-1.1	Swartkrans Member 2
SK11899	Antidorcas sp.	2.1	-0.8	Swartkrans Member 2
SK6106	Antidorcas sp.	-0.2	0.3	Swartkrans Member 2
SK11073	Antidorcas sp.	-12.7	-1.3	Swartkrans Member 2
SK 3014	Antidorcas sp.	-1.1	-0.8	Swartkrans Member 2
SK 14123	Antidorcas sp.	-12.7	0.8	Swartkrans Member 2
SK14070	Antidorcas marsupialis	-12.9	-1.9	Swartkrans Member 2
SK4054	Antidorcas marsupialis	-11.6	0.2	Swartkrans Member 2

SK 5958	Antidorcas marsupialis	-9.1	-0.8	Swartkrans Member 2
SK 4081	Antidorcas marsupialis	-10.3	0.4	Swartkrans Member 2
SK 2953	Antidorcas marsupialis	-15.0	-2.1	Swartkrans Member 2
SK 3055	Antidorcas marsupialis/ australis	-11.0	2.1	Swartkrans Member 2
SK 2366	Antidorcas bondi	-5.2	-2.2	Swartkrans Member 2
SK 40592	Antidorcas sp.	-2.2	0.4	Swartkrans Member 5
SKX 41059	Antidorcas australis/marsupialis	-7.3	-1.1	Swartkrans Member 5

471 TABLE 11: Stable carbon and oxygen isotope data for *Antidorcas* fossils from Swartkrans. *Antidorcas* sp. indicates specimens only

472 identifiable to genus level (specimens processed at the University of Liverpool).

- 473
- 474

Sterkfontein Member	4					
Species	Ν	Mean δ <sup>13</sup> C	Standard	Minimum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Maximum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Dietary category
-			deviation			
Antidorcas recki	10 <sup>1,2</sup>	-11.4	1.063	-14.0	-5.0	Browser
Antidorcas bondi	2 <sup>1,2</sup>	-1.3	0.020	-1.0	-1.0	Grazer
Damaliscus sp.	9 <sup>1</sup>	-1.8	1.256	-7	3.0	Grazer
Sterkfontein Member	5					
Antidorcas recki	2 <sup>1</sup>	-11.7	0.945	-13.0	-11.0	Browser
Damaliscus sp.	5 <sup>1</sup>	-1.3	1.055	-5.0	1.0	Grazer
Antidorcas sp.	3 <sup>1</sup>	-5.4	3.133	-10.0	1.0	Mixed
Sterkfontein Member	5 East / Oldow	an				
Species	Ν	Mean δ <sup>13</sup> C	Standard	Minimum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Maximum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Dietary category
-			deviation			
Damaliscus sp.	5 <sup>1</sup>	-2.7	0.965	-5.0	1.0	Grazer
Antidorcas sp.	<b>1</b> <sup>1</sup>	-9.2	х	-9.2	-9.2	Browser-Mixed
Sterkfontein Member	5 West/ Acheu	lean				
Species	Ν	Mean δ <sup>13</sup> C	Standard	Minimum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Maximum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Dietary category
			deviation			
Antidorcas recki	2 <sup>1</sup>	-11.7	0.945	-13.0	-11.0	Browser
Damaliscus sp.	7 <sup>1</sup>	-0.9	0.540	-3.0	1.0	Grazer
Swartkrans Member 2						
Species	Ν	Mean $\delta^{13}$ C	Standard	Minimum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Maximum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Dietary category
-			deviation			
Antidorcas recki	1 4	-12.9	Х	-12.9	-12.9	Browser
Antidorcas bondi	9 <sup>3</sup>	-3.3	0.334	-5.0	-2.0	Mixed-Grazer

Antidorcas sp.	27 <sup>4,5</sup>	-5.1	1.076	-15.0	2.0	Mixed
Modern						
Species	Ν	Mean δ <sup>13</sup> C	Standard deviation	Minimum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Maximum δ <sup>13</sup> C	Dietary category
Antidorcas marsupialis	2 <sup>6,7</sup>	-13.1*	4.00	-17.0*	-9.0*	Browser

TABLE 12: Stable carbon isotope descriptive statistics for *Antidorcas and Damaliscus* species present in each member. References: where more than one value is given in original reference, a mean value has been calculated and used here. Luyt 2001<sup>1</sup>; van der Merwe et al. 2003<sup>2</sup>; Lee-Thorp et al. 2000<sup>3</sup>; Lee-Thorp et al. 1994<sup>4</sup>; New isotope data (this study)<sup>5</sup>; Vogel 1978<sup>6</sup>; Sponheimer et al. 2003<sup>7</sup>. Dietary categories following category distinctions as set out in table 6. \*N.B. Modern *Antidorcas marsupialis* would be expected to be a mixed feeder. To aid comparison between the modern and fossil data, modern enamel values were increased by 1 ‰ to account for the post-industrial decrease in the  $\delta^{13}$ C value of atmospheric CO<sub>2</sub> (Francey et al., 1999). The blesbok, *Damaliscus pygargus (dorcas)* is typically considered to be a grazing species and indeed, *Damaliscus* is expected to largely be a grazing genus (Estes 1991). At Sterkfontein and Swartkrans, isotope data shows *Damaliscus sp.* to be true to expected dietary preferences and a small sample is included here to establish most-likely grazing parameters.

Stable carbon isotope results (Tables 11 & 12) support the dietary categories and vegetation signals obtained from use-wear (microwear and mesowear) analyses. However, *Antidorcas bondi* shows slight indications of more mixed feeding in Swartkrans Member 2, away from the specialized grazing signals apparent from the other methodologies. This perhaps lends support to the presence of more heterogeneous habitats for Swartkrans Member 2.

490

#### 491 **5. DISCUSSION**

492

This paper has used data from various dietary proxies of an abundant antelope to attempt a 493 detailed reconstruction of the palaeovegetation conditions through time at the important 494 495 hominin-bearing sites of the Cradle of Humankind. Each proxy, predictably, reflects a different aspect of the diets of the springboks. Combined, we have tried to use these datasets to address 496 497 two main questions: 1) can palaeodietary information be used to reconstruct habitat conditions 498 through time; and 2) what additional detail can we gain about the dietary differences between the different Antidorcas species in the fossil record? In response to the first question, the 499 dietary proxies from the Antidorcas examined in this study do yield palaeovegetation 500 reconstructions that broadly agree with habitat reconstructions based on other 501 palaeoenvironmental proxies. Our results suggest increased grassland post c.1.7 Ma, with 502 503 some suggestion of more heterogeneous habitats for Swartkrans Member 2 (c.1.65-1.07 Ma). A 504 reduced grassland presence in Swartkrans Member 2 is potentially indicated with the assumed-505 to-be grazing Antidorcas species, A. bondi, yielding a slightly mixed feeding dietary signal from 506 stable carbon isotope values. Whilst it is only slightly indicative of more mixed feeding practices, Antidorcas bondi specimens from Swartkrans Member 2 do exhibit dietary behavioral 507 508 difference when compared to A. bondi from other members, in which A. bondi is shown to be a 509 more faithful grazer (from stable carbon isotope values). Lee-Thorp et al. (2007) suggested the

510 lower  $\delta^{13}$ C values were indicative of either a remnant component of C<sub>3</sub> vegetation or less 511 specialized dietary taxa than their modern counterparts. However, dental microwear textures 512 studied here suggest *A. bondi* had a more mixed-feeding diet than previously assumed.

513

The second question regarding dietary niches in the various fossil species of *Antidorcas* is more complex. Our dietary reconstructions indicate a wide dietary range represented within the *Antidorcas* lineage, as we would expect from a mixed-feeder that survived changing habitat and vegetation conditions.

In contrast to Brink & Lee-Thorp (1992) all the fossil species of Antidorcas display high 518 519 values in dental microwear texture complexity (Asfc) which exclude grazing habitats. DMTA supports that all species of Antidorcas were mixed feeding, including herbaceous monocots and 520 browse (shrubs and foliages with lignified tissues, possibly with seeds and fruit). A. recki 521 displays a lower *epLsar* than the other *Antidorcas* species (see Table 5), and significantly lower 522 than the fossil A. marsupialis (Table 7). The dental microwear texture for fossil A. bondi here 523 shows it to have practiced greater mixed feeding than shown by the fossil A. marsupialis sample 524 (Figure 5). Dental microwear textures on A. recki are consistent with mesowear and isotopic 525 526 analysis in all supporting a higher browsing component in the diet compared to the other 527 Antidorcas species. Browsing is more likely to result in higher heterogeneity due to the nature and range of the browse vegetation consumed. 528 Interestingly, both fossil A. marsupialis/australis and A. recki have higher heterogeneity of diet, indicative of more mixed 529 feeding diets, higher than that of modern Antidorcas marsupialis, a known mixed-feeder. 530 Indeed, all DMTA supports Antidorcas being a predominantly mixed-feeding genus. 531

In interpreting these diets and what they mean in the wider context of habitat changes and the faunal community, we must also consider the role of biotic factors within the faunal community. Codron and colleagues (2008) highlight the role that niche specialization can play on changing diets of herbivores within a community, with both environmental and biotic (competition) factors contributing to the forcing of dietary differentiation into specific niches ( $C_3$  or  $C_4$ ). Antidorcas may have been in competition with other herbivore species such as the impala (*Aepyceros melampus*). Significant differences in tooth metrics analysed in this study indicate that the ancestral *A. recki* possessed smaller overall dental dimensions than modern *A. marsupialis*, supporting the results from previous studies (e.g. Vrba 1970, 1973) and strongly suggesting that *A. recki* possessed a smaller body size (Gentry 1978) than *A. marsupialis*. Body size can be informative of palaeoenvironmental conditions, and increases in body size can possibly be explained as an advantage in more seasonal environments where there is a longer period of fasting, a phenomenon known as fasting endurance (Millar and Hickling 1990; Reynolds 2007).

One of the outstanding problems in the fossil record is whether the extinct, Antidorcas 546 australis is a valid species or not. The original species description emphasizes the difference in 547 548 horncore shape, with A. australis having somewhat straighter horns than the lyrate form typical of A. marsupialis (Cooke and Wells, 1951). At present, we do not have enough data to 549 550 definitively identify clear dietary distinctions between fossils assigned to A. australis and those 551 assigned to A. marsupialis. The sample of fossil Antidorcas marsupialis/australis examined in this study does exhibit greater variation in measurements than modern Antidorcas marsupialis, 552 553 which could be argued to lend support to the idea of the presence of multiple species (Brophy 554 et al. 2014). Further landmark-based measurements and additional techniques, such as 555 geometric morphometric analysis (to analyse shape changes) would be required to settle the 556 question of this species distinction. It may be that the A. australis is differentiated only on its horncores and that dietary differences alone would not be sufficient to indicate distinctions 557 between A. australis and A. marsupialis. 558

559 Another important aspect of modern springbok ecology is the migratory behaviour. 560 Historic records show that springbok would trek in herds of thousands of individuals to seek out 561 fresh grazing after the rains (Skinner and Louw, 1996). At present, there is little way to 562 determine whether other extinct species of *Antidorcas* exhibited this behaviour or not. If so, *A.* 563 *australis*, may have been a migrant to the Cradle region at various times. Certainly, migration 564 would have helped reduce competition in grazing species.

565

566 As may be expected (e.g. Davis & Pineda-Munoz 2016), there is some disparity between 567 dietary signals from DMTA compared to those from stable carbon isotopes. DMTA indicates all 568 Antidorcas fossil species were mixed feeders, whereas carbon isotopes indicate higher C4 569 signals (i.e. grazing) for these antelopes, particularly the case for A. bondi. This combination 570 would support a mixed feeding dietary preference for Antidorcas, altering their dietary intake 571 according to seasonal availability of resources. This suggests that the Cradle of Humankind 572 region would have had seasonally available resources with significant amounts of both browse 573 and graze. If severe seasonal droughts decimated the herbaceous layer (where grasses are 574 abundant) then the antelopes may have switched to browse as tree/shrub roots go deeper in 575 the soil to obtain water, compared to the herbaceous plants.

576

## 577 SUMMARY

In this paper, we examined fossil Antidorcas dentition using a range of dietary proxies, from 578 579 these results we attempted to infer the prevailing vegetation conditions between 2.8-0.8 Ma 580 for the region where these Antidorcas lived and died, the Cradle of Humankind, South Africa. The majority of past research has used a single methodology on multiple species from 581 assemblages, to address palaeoenvironmental questions. Here, we implemented a multiproxy 582 analysis on a single mixed-feeding, herbivorous and abundant genus (Antidorcas) to provide a 583 584 detailed palaeovegetation picture for the Sterkfontein and Swartkrans area through time. Aside 585 from some subtle variations, preliminary conclusions from our study are found to be in broad agreement with those found through isotopic analysis by Lee-Thorp et al. (2007), of increased 586 grassland presence in South Africa from ca .1.7 Ma. 587

588

589 Notably, we have been able to suggest from this multi-method approach, that methods can 590 be reliably substituted for one another where time or cost constraints apply. Where methods 591 such as mesowear, are non-destructive, quick and cheap to implement, these techniques can 592 be used to accurately pinpoint where to concentrate the more time-consuming, expensive and 593 destructive techniques, such as stable carbon isotope analysis. However, a more holistic, robust and detailed palaeovegetation reconstruction can be achieved by using complementary 594 595 methodologies. The complementary use of methods such as mesowear analysis, stable isotope 596 analysis and dental microwear texture analyses for instance, allows us to question whether 597 *Antidorcas bondi* was typically a grazer or not. This approach could be implemented at other 598 sites across the world for palaeovegetation reconstructions, where the preserved faunal 599 community is restricted in some way but where at least one continuous (mixed feeding) 600 herbivore lineage is represented.

601

## 602 Acknowledgements:

We would like to thank Dr John Stewart and Professor Matthew Bennett for supervision and 603 guidance in the wider project; to the curators of the Natural History Museum, London (Roberto 604 Portela Miguez) and National Museums Scotland, Edinburgh (Zena Timmons) for access to the 605 606 collections in their care and to the University of the Witwatersrand, Johannesburg (Bernhard Zipfel) and the Ditsong Museum of Natural History (Stephany Potze, Lazarus Kgasi and Heidi 607 Fourie), Pretoria for access to the Cradle of Humankind fossil material. Thank-you also to Lucile 608 Crété for providing photographs of Antidorcas recki from West Turkana (courtesy of National 609 Museums of Kenya collection). 610

611

Funding: This work was supported by Bournemouth University as part of an Institute for theStudy of Landscapes and Human Evolution (ISLHE) PhD studentship.

- 614
- 615

#### 616 **REFERENCES**

Albarède, F., Balter, V., Braga, J., Blichert-Toft, J., Telouk, P. and Thackeray, F., 2006. U–Pb

dating of enamel from the Swartkrans Cave hominid site (South Africa) by MC-ICP-MS. *Goldschmidt Conference Abstracts*. A7.

- 620 Antón, S.C., 2003. Natural history of Homo erectus. *American journal of physical* 621 *anthropology* 122 (S37), 126-170.
- Antón, S.C., Potts, R. and Aiello, L.C., 2014. Evolution of early *Homo*: An integrated biological
   perspective. *Science*, *345* (6192), 1236828.
- Avery, D.M., 2001. The Plio-Pleistocene vegetation and climate of Sterkfontein and Swartkrans,
- 625 South Africa, based on micromammals. *Journal of Human Evolution*, *41* (2), 113-132.

- Balter, V., Blichert-Toft, J., Braga, J., Telouk, P., Thackeray, F. and Albarède, F., 2008. U–Pb
- 627 dating of fossil enamel from the Swartkrans Pleistocene hominid site, South 628 Africa. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 267 (1), 236-246.
- Bamford. M. 1999. Pliocene fossil woods from an early hominid cave deposit, Sterkfontein,
- 630 South Africa. *South African Journal of Science* 95, 231-237.
- 631 Bednekoff, P.A. and Ritter, R.C., 1997. Adult sex ratio of a wild population of Springbok
- 632 (Antidorcas marsupialis) at Nxai pan, Botswana. South African Journal of Wildlife
  633 Research 27 (1), 22-24.
- 634 Berger, L.R., Lacruz, R. and De Ruiter, D.J., 2002. Revised age estimates of Australopithecus-
- bearing deposits at Sterkfontein, South Africa. American Journal of Physical
  Anthropology 119 (2),192-197.
- 637 Berger, L.R., de Ruiter, D.J., Churchill, S.E., Schmid, P, Carlson, K.J., Dirks, P.H.G.M. and Kibii,
- J.M., 2010. Australopithecus sediba: A new species of Homo-like Australopith from
  South Africa. Science 328, 195-204.
- Blondel, C., Merceron, G., Andossa, L., Taisso, M.H., Vignaud, P. and Brunet, M., 2010. Dental
  mesowear analysis of the late Miocene Bovidae from Toros-Menalla (Chad) and early
  hominid habitats in Central Africa. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*292 (1), 184-191.
- Blumenthal, S.A., Levin, N.E., Brown, F.H., Brugal, J.P., Chritz, K.L., Harris, J.M., Jehle, G.E. and
   Cerling, T.E., 2017. Aridity and hominin environments. *Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences*+ 114 (28), 7331-7336.
- Bobe, R., and Behrensmeyer, A.K., 2004. The expansion of grassland ecosystems in Africa in
  relation to mammalian evolution and the origin of the genus *Homo. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology*. 207, 399-420.
- Bobe, R., & Eck, G.G., 2001. Responses of African Bovids to Pliocene Climatic Change. *Paleobiology* 27 (2), 1-48.
- Brain, C. K. 1993. Structure and stratigraphy of the Swartkrans Cave in the Light of the new
- 653 excavations. In: C. K. Brain (ed.) Swartkrans: A Cave's Chronicle of early Man. Transvaal
- 654 Monograph No 8: 23-34. Pretoria, Transvaal Museum.

Brain, C.K., 1995. The Influence of Climatic changes on the Completeness of the early Hominid

- 656Record in Southern African Caves, with Particular Reference to Swartkrans. IN: Vrba, E.S.,657Denton, G. H., Partridge, T.C., & Burckle, L. H. (eds.). Paleoclimate and Evolution with
- 658 emphasis on human origins. Yale University Press: New Haven. P.451-458.
- Brakora, K., 2014. The ontogeny of sexual dimorphism in the skull of the springbok antelope
  (Antidorcas marsupialis) (918.7). The FASEB Journal, 28 (1 Supplement) 918-7.
- Brink, J.S. and Lee-Thorp, J.A., 1992 The feeding niche of an extinct springbok, Antidorcas bondi
- 662 (Antelopini, Bovidae), and its palaeoenvironmental meaning. South African Journal of
  663 Science. 88, 227-229.
- Brink, J.S., de Beer, F.C., Hoffman, J. and Bam, L., 2013. The evolutionary meaning of
- 665 *Raphicerus*-like morphology in the dentitions and postcrania of *Antidorcas bondi* 666 (Antilopini). Zitteliana, p.21.
- 667 Brink, J.S., 2016. Faunal evidence for Mid-and Late Quaternary environmental change in 668 southern Africa. *Quaternary Environmental Change in Southern Africa: Physical and* 669 *Human Dimensions*. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, UK p. 286-307.
- Broom, R., 1938. The Pleistocene anthropoid apes of South Africa. *Nature*, *142*, 377-379.
- 671 Brophy, J.K., 2011. Reconstructing the habitat mosaic associated with Australopithecus
- 672 *robustus*: Evidence from quantitative morphological analysis of bovid teeth (Doctoral
  673 dissertation, Texas A&M University).
- Brophy, J.K., de Ruiter, D.J., Athreya, S. and DeWitt, T.J., 2014. Quantitative morphological
  analysis of bovid teeth and implications for paleoenvironmental reconstruction of
  Plovers Lake, Gauteng Province, South Africa. *Journal of Archaeological Science* 41, 376388.
- Calandra, I. and Merceron, G., 2016. Dental microwear texture analysis in mammalian ecology.
   *Mammal Review* 46 (3), 215-228.
- Castelló, J.R., 2016. Bovids of the World: Antelopes, Gazelles, Cattle, Goats, Sheep, and
   Relatives. Princeton University Press.
- 682 Cerling, T.E. and Harris, J.M., 1999. Carbon isotope fractionation between diet and bioapatite in

- 683 ungulate mammals and implications for ecological and paleoecological studies.
  684 *Oecologia*, 120(3), pp.347-363.
- 685 Churcher, C.S. and Watson, V. 1993. Additional fossil Equidae from Swartkrans. In: Brain, C.K.
- (ed.), Swartkrans: A Cave's Chronicle of Early Man. *Transvaal Museum Monograph No.*8. Pretoria: Transvaal Museum, pp. 137–150.
- Clarke, R.J., 2008. Latest information on Sterkfontein's *Australopithecus* skeleton and a new
   look at *Australopithecus*. South African Journal of Science 104(11-12), 443-449.
- Codron, D., Brink, J.S., Rossouw, L. and Clauss, M., 2008. The evolution of ecological
   specialization in southern African ungulates: competition-or physical environmental
- 692 turnover? *Oikos* 117 (3), 344-353.
- Cooke, H.B.S. and Wells, L.H., 1951. Fossil remains from Chelmer, near Bulawayo, Southern
   Rhodesia. South African Journal of Science 47 (7), 205-9.
- 695 Curnoe, D., Grün, R., Taylor, L. and Thackeray, F., 2001. Direct ESR dating of a Pliocene hominin
   696 from Swartkrans. *Journal of Human Evolution 40* (5), 379-391.
- 697 Dart, R.A., 1925. *Australopithecus africanus*: the man-ape of South Africa. *Nature* 115, 195-199.
- Davis, M. and Pineda-Munoz, S., 2016. The temporal scale of diet and dietary proxies. *Ecology and evolution* 6 (6), 1883-1897.
- 700 Delson, E., 1988. Chronology of South African australopith site units. IN: Grine,
- 701 F.E., Evolutionary history of the 'robust'australopithecines pp.317-324.
- deMenocal, P.B., 1995. Plio-Pleistocene African climate. Science, pp.53-59.
- deMenocal, P.B., 2004. African climate change and faunal evolution in the Pliocene-Pleistocene.
- *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* 220 (1), 3-24.
- deMenocal, P.B., 2011. Climate and Human Evolution: Climate change and its effects on African
   ecosystems may have played a role in human evolution. *Science*. 331, 540-542.
- de Ruiter, D.J. 2003a. Relative abundance, skeletal part representation and accumulating agents
- of macromammals at Swartkrans. IN: Brain, C.K. (Ed.), Swartkrans: A Cave's Chronicle of
- *Early Man. Transvaal Museum Monograph* No. 8. Pretoria: Transvaal Museum, P. 265–
  278.
- de Ruiter, D.J. 2003b. Revised faunal lists for members 1–3 of Swartkrans. Annals of the

- 712 *Transvaal Museum* 40, 29–41.
- de Ruiter, D., Sponheimer, M., and Lee-Thorp, J., 2008. Indications of habitat association of
   *Australopithecus robustus* in the Bloubank Valley, South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 55 (6), 1015-30.
- DeSantis, L.R., 2016. Dental microwear textures: reconstructing diets of fossil mammals. *Surface Topography: Metrology and Properties* 4 (2), p.023002.
- Estes, R., 1991. *The behavior guide to African mammals* (20<sup>th</sup> Anniversary Edition). Berkeley,
   University of California Press.
- Faith, J.T., 2014. Late Pleistocene and Holocene mammal extinctions on continental Africa.
   *Earth-*
- 722 Science Reviews, 128, pp.105-121.
- Francey, R.J., Allison, C.E., Etheridge, D.M., Trudinger, C.M., Enting, I.G., Leuenberger, M.,
   Langenfelds, R.L., Michel, E. and Steele, L.P., 1999. A 1000-year high precision record of
   δ13C in atmospheric CO2. *Tellus B* 51 (2), 170-193.
- Fortelius, M. & Solounias, N., 2000. Functional Characterization of Ungulate Molars Using the
   Abrasion-Attrition Wear Gradient: A new method for reconstructing Paleodiets.
- 728 American Museum Noviates 3301, 1-36.
- Gentry, A.W., 1978. Bovidae. IN: Maglio, V.J. and Cooke, H.B.S. (Eds.) *Evolution of African mammals*. Cambridge University Press: London.
- Gentry, A.W., 1992. The subfamilies and tribes of the family Bovidae. *Mammal Review* 22 (1), 132.
- Gentry, A.W., 2010. Bovidae. IN: Werdelin, L. and Sanders, W.J., (Eds). *Cenozoic mammals of Africa.* University of California Press. P.741-796.
- Gentry, A.W., 2011. Bovidae. IN: Harrison, T. (Ed). *Paleontology and geology of Laetoli: Human evolution in context*, 363-465. Springer, Netherlands.
- Gwynne, M.D. and Bell, R.H.V., 1968. Selection of vegetation components by grazing ungulates
  in the Serengeti National Park. *Nature* 220 (5165), 390-393.
- 739 Hare, V. and Sealy, J., 2013. Middle Pleistocene dynamics of southern Africa's winter rainfall

- zone from δ 13 C and δ 18 O values of Hoedjiespunt faunal enamel. *Palaeogeography*,
   *Palaeoclimatology*, *Palaeoecology* 374, 72-80.
- Hendey, Q.B. and Hendey, H., 1968. New Quaternary fossil sites near Swartklip, Cape Province.
  South African Museum.
- Hendey, Q.B., 1974. Faunal dating of the late Cenozoic of Southern Africa, with special
   reference to the Carnivora. *Quaternary Research 4* (2), 149-161.
- Herries, A.I., Curnoe, D., and Adams. J.W., 2009. A multi-disciplinary seriation of early *Homo*and *Paranthropus* bearing palaeocaves in southern Africa. *Quaternary International* 202,
  14-28.
- 749 Herries, A.I. and Shaw, J., 2011. Palaeomagnetic analysis of the Sterkfontein palaeocave
- 750 deposits: Implications for the age of the hominin fossils and stone tool 751 industries. *Journal of Human Evolution* 60 (5), 523-539.
- Hopley, P. J., Latham, A. G. and Marshall, J. D. (2006). Palaeoenvironments and palaeodiets of
   mid-Pliocene micromammals from Makapansgat Limeworks, South Africa: a stable
   isotope and dental microwear approach. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 233, 235-251.
- Hopley, P.J., Marshall, J.D., Weedon, G.P., Latham, A.G., Herries, A.I.R. and Kuykendall, K.L.,
  2007. Orbital forcing and the spread of C4 grasses in the late Neogene: stable isotope
  evidence from South African speleothems. *Journal of Human Evolution* 53 (5) 620-634.
- Hopley, P. J. and Maslin, M.A., 2010. Climate-averaging of terrestrial faunas: an example from
  the Plio-Pleistocene of South Africa. *Palaeobiology*. 36 (1), 32-50.
- Hughes, A.R. and Tobias, P.V., 1977. A fossil skull probably of the genus *Homo* from
  Sterkfontein, Transvaal. *Nature*, 265 (5592), 310-312.
- 763 Kaiser, T.M. and Fortelius, M., 2003. Differential mesowear in occluding upper and lower
- molars: opening mesowear analysis for lower molars and premolars in hypsodont
  horses. *Journal of Morphology*, 258 (1) 67-83.
- Kaiser, T.M. and Solounias, N., 2003. Extending the tooth mesowear method to extinct and
   extant equids. *Geodiversitas*, 25(2) 321-345.
- Kangas, A.T., Evans, A.R., Thesleff, I. and Jernvall, J., 2004. Nonindependence of mammalian

769

- dental characters. Nature 432 (7014), 211.
- Kaya, F., Bibi, F., Žliobaitė, I., Eronen, J.T., Hui, T. and Fortelius, M., 2018. The rise and fall of the
   Old World savannah fauna and the origins of the African savannah biome. *Nature Ecology and Evolution*. doi: 10.1038/s41559-017-0414-1.
- Klein, R.G., 1980. Environmental and ecological implications of large mammals from Upper
   Pleistocene and Holocene sites in southern Africa. South African Museum.
- Klein, R.G., 1986. Carnivore size and Quaternary climatic change in southern Africa. *Quaternary Research*, 26 (1) 153-170.
- Kuman, K., and Clarke, R., 2000. Stratigraphy, artefact industries and hominid associations for
   Sterkfontein, Member 5. *Journal of Human Evolution* 38 (6), 827-847.
- Leakey, L.S.B., 1960. Recent discoveries at Olduvai Gorge. *Nature*, 188 (4755),1050-1052.
- 780 Lee-Thorp, J.A., van der Merwe, N.J. and Brain, C.K., 1994. Diet of Australopithecus robustus at
- 781 Swartkrans from stable carbon isotopic analysis. *Journal of Human Evolution* 27 (4), 361782 372.
- Lee-Thorp, J.A., Manning, L. and Sponheimer, M., 1997. Problems and prospects for carbon
   isotope analysis of very small samples of fossil tooth enamel. *Bulletin de la Société géologique de France* 168 (6), 767-773.
- Lee-Thorp, J., Thackeray, J.F., and van der Merwe, N., 2000. The Hunters and the Hunted
   revisited. *Journal of Human Evolution* 39 (6) 565-576.
- Lee-Thorp, J.A., Sponheimer, M., & Luyt, J., 2007 Tracking changing environments using stable
   carbon isotopes in fossil tooth enamel: an example from the South African hominin s
   ites. *Journal of Human Evolution* 53, 595-601.

Lehmann, D., 2015. Dietary and spatial strategies of gemsbok (*Oryx g. gazella*) and springbok

- (Antidorcas marsupialis) in response to drought in the desert environment of the
   Kunene Region, Namibia (Doctoral dissertation, Freie Universität Berlin).
- Loffredo, L.F. and DeSantis, L.R., 2014. Cautionary lessons from assessing dental mesowear
   observer variability and integrating paleoecological proxies of an extreme generalist
   *Cormohipparion emsliei. Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* 395, 42-
- 797

52.

Lucas, P.W., 2004. Dental functional morphology: how teeth work. Cambridge University Press.

- Luyt, J., 2001. Revisiting the palaeoenvironments of the South African hominid-bearing Plio
- Pleistocene sites: new isotopic evidence from Sterkfontein. MSc Thesis; Uniniversity of
   Cape Town.
- Luyt, C.J. and Lee-Thorp, J.A., 2003. Carbon isotope ratios of Sterkfontein fossils indicate a marked shift to open environments c. 1.7 Myr ago: research articles: human origins research in South Africa. *South African Journal of Science* 99 (5-6), 271-273.
- McKee, J.K., 1993. Taxonomic and evolutionary affinities of Papio izodi fossils from Taung and
   Sterkfontein. Palaeontologica Africana 30, 43-49.
- Merceron, G., Schulz, E., Kordos, L. and Kaiser, T.M., 2007. Paleoenvironment of Dryopithecus
   brancoi at Rudabánya, Hungary: evidence from dental meso-and micro-wear analyses of
   large vegetarian mammals. *Journal of Human Evolution* 53(4), 331-349.
- 810 Merceron, G., Ramdarshan, A., Arthur Francisco, A., Denis Gautier, D., Boisserie, J., Milhet, X.,
- Novello, A., and Pret, D. 2016. Untangling the environmental from the dietary: dust does
  not matter. *Proceedings of the Royal Society of London B: Biological Sciences* 283 (1838),
  20161032.
- Millar, J.S. & Hickling, G.J., 1990. Fasting endurance and the evolution of mammalian body size.
   *Functional Ecology* 4 (1), 5-12.
- Nagy, K.A. and Knight, M.H., 1994. Energy, water, and food use by springbok antelope
- 817 (Antidorcas marsupialis) in the Kalahari Desert. Journal of Mammalogy 75(4), 860-872.
- O'Leary, M.H., 1981. Carbon isotope fractionation in plants. *Phytochemistry* 20, 553–567.
- Partridge, T.C., 2005. Dating of the Sterkfontein hominids: progress and possibilities: aspects of
  hominid evolution. *Transactions of the Royal Society of South Africa* 60 (2), 107-109.
- Pickering, R. and Kramers, J.D., 2010. Re-appraisal of the stratigraphy and determination of new
- U-Pb dates for the Sterkfontein hominin site, South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 59 (1), 70-86.
- Plummer, T.W. and Bishop, L.C., 1994. Hominid paleoecology at Olduvai Gorge, Tanzania as
   indicated by antelope remains. *Journal of Human Evolution* 27 (1-3), 47-75.

- Ramdarshan, A., Blondel, C., Gautier, D., Surault, J. and Merceron, G., 2017. Overcoming
   sampling issues in dental tribology: Insights from an experimentation on sheep.
   *Palaeontologia Electronica* 20 (3), 1-19.
- Ramdarshan, A., Blondel, C., Brunetière, N., Francisco, A., Gautier, D., Surault, J. and Merceron,
- G., 2016. Seeds, browse, and tooth wear: a sheep perspective. *Ecology and Evolution*, 6
  (16), 5559-5569.
- Reade, H., Stevens, R.E., Barker, G. and O'Connell, T.C., 2015. Tooth enamel sampling strategies
  for stable isotope analysis: Potential problems in cross-method data comparisons.
  Chemical Geology, 404, pp.126-135
- 835 Reed, K.E., 1997. Early hominid evolution and ecological change through the African Plio-

Pleistocene. *Journal of human evolution*, *32* (2), 289-322.

- Reynolds, S.C., 2005. *Geographic variation in selected African mammalian taxa: a comparison of modern and fossil conspecifics*. PhD Thesis, Liverpool John Moores University.
- Reynolds, S.C., 2007. Mammalian body size changes and Plio-Pleistocene environmental shifts:
   implications for understanding hominin evolution in eastern and southern Africa.

341 Journal of Human Evolution 53, 528-548.

- Reynolds, S. C. & Kibii, J. M., 2011. Sterkfontein at 75: review of Palaeoenvironments, fauna and
  archaeology from the hominin site of Sterkfontein (Gauteng Province, South Africa). *Palaeontologia Africana*. 46, 59-88.
- 845 Reynolds, S. C.; Wilkinson, D. M. and Marston, C. G and O'Regan, H. J. 2015. The 'mosaic

habitat' in human evolution: past and present. Transactions of the Royal Society of

847 *South Africa*, Vol. 70, No. 1, 57–69, http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/0035919X.2015.1007490

- Richie, M.E. and Olff, H., 1999. Spatial scaling laws yield a synthetic theory of biodiversity
   *Nature* 400 (6744), 557-560.
- Schulz, E., Piotrowski, V., Clauss, M., Mau, M., Merceron, G. and Kaiser, T.M., 2013. Dietary
- abrasiveness is associated with variability of microwear and dental surface texture in rabbits. *PLoS One* 8 (2), p.e56167.
- 853 Schubert, B.W., Ungar, P.S., Sponheimer, M. and Reed, K.E., 2006. Microwear evidence for Plio-
- 854 Pleistocene bovid diets from Makapansgat Limeworks Cave, South Africa.

- Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology, 241(2), pp.301-319.
- Schwarcz, H.P., Grün, R. and Tobias, P.V., 1994. ESR dating studies of the australopithecine site
  of Sterkfontein, South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 26 (3), 175-181
- Schwarz, E., 1932. Neue diluviale Antilopen aus Ostafrika. Zentralblatt für Mineralogie, Geologie
  und Paläontologie B, 1932, pp.1-4.
- Scott, R.S., Ungar, P.S., Bergstrom, T.S., Brown, C.A., Childs, B.E., Teaford, M.F. and Walker, A.,
- 2006. Dental microwear texture analysis: technical considerations. *Journal of Human Evolution* 51 (4), 339-349.
- Scott, J.R., 2012. Dental microwear texture analysis of extant African Bovidae. Mammalia 76 (2),
  157-174.
- Ségalen, L., Lee-Thorp, J.A. and Cerling, T., 2007. Timing of C 4 grass expansion across subSaharan Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 53 (5), 549-559.
- Sepulchre, P., Ramstein, G., Fluteau, F., Schuster, M., Tiercelin, J.J. and Brunet, M., 2006.
   Tectonic uplift and Eastern Africa aridification. *Science* 313 (5792) 1419-1423.
- 869 Skinner, J.D. and Chimimba, C.T., 2005. The mammals of the southern African sub-region.

870 Cambridge University Press.

871 Skinner JD, Louw GN. 1996. The springbok Antidorcas marsupialis (Zimmerman 1780). Transvaal
872 Museum

873 Monographs 10:1–50.

- Spencer, L.M., 1997. Dietary adaptations of Plio-Pleistocene Bovidae: implications for hominid
  habitat use. *Journal of Human Evolution*, 32 (2) 201-228.
- 876 Sponheimer, M., Lee-Thorp, J.A., DeRuiter, D.J., Smith, J.M., Van Der Merwe, N.J., Reed, K.,
- Grant, C.C., Ayliffe, L.K., Robinson, T.F., Heidelberger, C. and Marcus, W., 2003. Diets of
  southern African Bovidae: stable isotope evidence. *Journal of Mammalogy* 84 (2), 471479.
- 880 Stapelberg, H., Van Rooyen, M.W., Bothma, J.D.P., Van der Linde, M.J. and Groeneveld, H.T.,
- 2008. Springbok behaviour as affected by environmental conditions in the Kalahari.
  Koedoe, 50(1), pp.145-153.
- Teaford, M.F. and Oyen, O.J., 1989. In vivo and in vitro turnover in dental microwear. *American Journal of Physical Anthropology* 80 (4), 447-460.

- Ungar, P.S., Merceron, G. and Scott, R.S., 2007. Dental microwear texture analysis of Varswater
   bovids and early Pliocene paleoenvironments of Langebaanweg, Western Cape
   Province, South Africa. *Journal of Mammalian Evolution*, *14*(3), 163-181.
- Ungar, S., Scott, J. R., and Steininger, C. M., 2016. Dental Microwear differences between
   eastern and southern African fossil bovids and hominins. *South African Journal of Science* 112 (3/4) 5 pages.
- Van der Merwe, N.J., Thackeray, J.F., Lee-Thorp, J.A. and Luyt, J., 2003. The carbon isotope
  ecology and diet of *Australopithecus africanus* at Sterkfontein, South Africa. *Journal of Human Evolution* 44 (5), 581-597.
- Vogel, J.C., 1978. Isotopic assessment of the dietary habits of ungulates. *South African Journal of Science* 74, 298-301.
- Von den Driesch, A., 1976. A Guide to the Measurement of Animal Bones from Archaeological
   Sites. Bulletin 1. Peabody Museum Bulletins: Harvard University.
- Vrba, E.S., 1970. Evaluation of springbok-like fossils: measurement and statistical treatment of
   the teeth of the springbok, Antidorcas marsupialis marsupialis Zimmerman
   (Artiodactyla: Bovidae). Annals of the Transvaal Museum 26(13), 285-299.
- 901 Vrba, E.S., 1973. Two species of *Antidorcas* Sundevall at Swartkrans (Mammalia: Bovidae).
  902 Annals of the Transvaal Museum 28 (15), 287-352.
- 903 Vrba, E.S., 1974. Chronological and ecological implications of the fossil Bovidae at the
  904 Sterkfontein australopithecine site. *Nature* 250, 19-23.
- Vrba, E.S., 1975. Some evidence of chronology and palaeoecology of Sterkfontein, Swartkrans
  and Kromdraai from the fossil Bovidae. *Nature*, *254*, 301-304.
- 907 Vrba, E., 1976. *The fossil bovidae of Sterkfontein, Swartkrans and Kromdraai*. Ph.D. Thesis,
- 908 University of the Witwatersrand.
- 909 Vrba, E.S., 1980. The significance of bovid remains as indicators of environment and predation
- 910 patterns. IN: Behrensmeyer, A.K., and Hill, A.P. (Eds.) *Fossils in the Making*. The
- 911 University of Chicago Press: Chicago and London.
- Vrba, E.S., 1982. Biostratigraphy and chronology, based particularly on Bovidae, of southern

- hominid-associated assemblages: Makapansgat, Sterkfontein, Taung, Kromdraai,
  Swartkrans; also Elandsfontein (Saldanha), Broken Hill (now Kabwe) and Cave of
  Hearths. In *Proceedings of the 1st International Congress on Human Palaeontology* 2,
  707-752.
- 917 Vrba, E. S., 1985. Environment and evolution: alternative causes of the temporal distribution of
  918 evolutionary events. *South African Journal of Science* 81, 229-236.
- 919 Vrba, E. S., 1995a. The Fossil Record of African Antelopes (Mammalia, Bovidae) in Relation to
- Human Evolution and Paleoclimate. IN: Vrba, E.S., Denton, G. H., Partridge, T.C., &
  Burckle, L. H. (eds.). Paleoclimate and Evolution with emphasis on human origins. Yale
  University Press: New Haven. P.385-424.
- 923 Vrba, E. S., 1995b. On the connections between palaeoclimate and evolution. IN: Vrba, E.S.,
- 924 Denton, G. H., Partridge, T.C., & Burckle, L. H. (eds.). Paleoclimate and Evolution with 925 emphasis on human origins. Yale University Press: New Haven. P24-45.
- 926 Vrba, E.S., 2000. Major features of Neogene mammalian evolution in Africa. OXFORD
   927 MONOGRAPHS ON GEOLOGY AND GEOPHYSICS 40, 277-304.
- 928 Vrba, E.S., and Schaller, G.B., 2000. Phylogeny of Bovidae Based on Behaviour, Glands, Skulls,
- 929and Postcrania. IN: Vrba, E.S. and Schaller, G.B. (Eds.) Antelopes, Deer, and Relatives:930Fossil Record, Behavioural Ecology, Systematics, and Conservation. Yale University Press:
- 931 New Haven. 203-222.
- 232 Zimmerman, E.A.W., 1780. Antidorcas marsupialis. Geographische Geschichte des Menschen,
- 933 und der vierf ssigen Thiere. Zweiter Band. Enth It ein vollstndiges Verzeichniss aller bekannten
- 934 *Quadrupeden. Weygandschen Buchhandlung* 2, 427. Leipzig, Germany.
- 935